

HOBOKEN ZONING BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT
CITY OF HOBOKEN

----- X
SPECIAL MEETING OF THE :
HOBOKEN ZONING BOARD OF : May 20, 2014
ADJUSTMENT : Tuesday 7:25 p.m.
----- X:

Held At: 94 Washington Street
Hoboken, New Jersey

B E F O R E:

- Chairman James Aibel
- Vice Chair Elliot H. Greene
- Commissioner Michael DeFusco
- Commissioner Diane Fitzmyer Murphy
- Commissioner Tiffanie Fisher
- Commissioner Owen McAnuff
- Commissioner Richard Tremitedi

A L S O P R E S E N T:

- Eileen Banyra, Planning Consultant
- Jeffrey Marsden, PE, PP
Board Engineer
- Patricia Carcone, Board Secretary

PHYLLIS T. LEWIS
CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER
CERTIFIED REALTIME REPORTER
Phone: (732) 735-4522

1 A P P E A R A N C E S:

2 DENNIS M. GALVIN, ESQUIRE
3 730 Brewers Bridge Road
4 Jackson, New Jersey 08527
5 (732) 364-3011
6 Attorney for the Board.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I N D E X

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PAGE

Board Business 1

RESOLUTIONS:

212 Eighth Street 6

1426-1428 Willow Avenue 6

HEARINGS:

1300-1330 Jefferson Street 8

1 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Good evening,
2 everybody.

3 It is 7:25. Apologies for the delay.
4 We are a little slow getting started, but I would
5 like to advise all of those present that notice of
6 the meeting has been provided to the public in
7 accordance with the provisions of the Open Public
8 Meetings Act, and that notice was published in The
9 Jersey Journal and city website. Copies were
10 provided in The Star-Ledger, The Record, and also
11 placed on the bulletin board in the lobby of City
12 Hall.

13 Please join me in the Pledge of
14 Allegiance.

15 (Pledge of Alliegance recited)

16 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: So good evening,
17 everybody.

18 We are at a Hoboken Zoning Board of
19 Adjustment Special Meeting, May 20th, 2014.

20 If anybody in the room is here for
21 Neumann Leather, you are in the wrong place. There
22 is a Neumann Leather's redevelopment planned
23 community workshop occurring at the Multi-Purpose
24 Center.

25 We have a couple of business items that

1 we will take care of first after we get a roll call.

2 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Aibel?

3 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Here.

4 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Greene?

5 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Here.

6 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Cohen is
7 absent.

8 Commissioner DeFusco?

9 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Here.

10 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Grana is
11 absent.

12 Commissioner Murphy?

13 COMMISSIONER MURPHY: Here.

14 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Branciforte
15 is absent.

16 Commissioner Fisher?

17 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Here.

18 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner McAnuff?

19 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Here.

20 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Tremitedi?

21 COMMISSIONER TREMITIEDI: Here.

22 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Great, thanks.

23 So first we have a couple of
24 resolutions. The first is a resolution of denial
25 for the application of Raphael Zagury, Block 183,

1 Lot 2, 212 Eighth Street.

2 MS. CARCONE: I have it.

3 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Thank you.

4 Those entitled to vote in favor to deny
5 are Mr. Greene, Mr. DeFusco, Ms. Murphy, and I can
6 vote as well.

7 Can I have a motion to approve the
8 resolution of denial?

9 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Motion to
10 approve.

11 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Can I have a second?

12 VICE CHAIR GREENE: I'll second it.

13 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Thank you.

14 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Greene?

15 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Yes.

16 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner DeFusco?

17 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Yes.

18 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Murphy?

19 COMMISSIONER MURPHY: Yes.

20 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Aibel?

21 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Yes.

22 Now, we have a resolution of approval
23 for the application of 1426 Willow Avenue, LLC,
24 Block 123, Lot 13, 1425-1428 Willow Avenue.

25 Those entitled to vote for the

1 resolution of approval are Mr. DeFusco, Mr.
2 Tremitedi, and I can vote as well.

3 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Motion to
4 approve the resolution.

5 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Thank you.

6 Can I have a second?

7 COMMISSIONER TREMITIEDI: I will second
8 it.

9 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner DeFusco?

10 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Yes.

11 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Tremitedi?

12 COMMISSIONER TREMITIEDI: Yes.

13 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Aibel?

14 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Yes.

15 Great.

16 (Continue on next page)

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HOBOKEN ZONING BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT
CITY OF HOBOKEN

----- X
 1300-1330 Jefferson Street : SPECIAL MEETING
 Block 112, Lot 1-32 :
 Applicant: Just Block 112, LLC : May 20, 2014
 Preliminary Site Plan & Variances : Tuesday 7:30 p.m.
 ----- X

Held At: 94 Washington Street
Hoboken, New Jersey

B E F O R E:

Chairman James Aibel
 Vice Chair Elliot H. Greene
 Commissioner Michael DeFusco
 Commissioner Diane Fitzmyer Murphy
 Commissioner Tiffanie Fisher
 Commissioner Owen McAnuff
 Commissioner Richard Tremitedi

A L S O P R E S E N T:

Eileen Banyra, Planning Consultant
 Jeffrey Marsden, PE, PP
 Board Engineer
 Patricia Carcone, Board Secretary

PHYLLIS T. LEWIS
 CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER
 CERTIFIED REALTIME REPORTER
 Phone: (732) 735-4522

1 P P E A R A N C E S:

2 DENNIS M. GALVIN, ESQUIRE
3 730 Brewers Bridge Road
4 Jackson, New Jersey 08527
(732) 364-3011
Attorney for the Board.

5
6 ROBERT C. MATULE, ESQUIRE
7 89 Hudson Street
8 Hoboken, New Jersey 07030
(201) 659-0403
Attorney for the Applicant.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I N D E X

1		
2	WITNESS	PAGE
3	MARK LUIS VILLAMAR	14
4	FRANK MINERVINI	20 & 109
5	HANY AHMED	106
6	TOM CHARTIER	115
7	JOSEPH STAIGAR	147

8

9

E X H I B I T S

10			
	EXHIBIT NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE
11	A-1	Photo Board	21
12	A-2	Photo Board	24
	A-3	Rendering	27
13	A-4	Rendering	30
	A-5	Rendering	32
14	A-6	Rendering	33
	A-7	Rendering	47
15	A-8	Rendering	47
	A-9	Checklist	116

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: So let me take a
2 minute while our counsel is getting his machine
3 warmed up to welcome everybody. There are a lot of
4 new faces in the room, so let me just take 60
5 seconds or less to give sort of a high level view of
6 how we conduct our hearings.

7 Basically what we are going to do is
8 ask counsel for the applicant to come up, present a
9 case. He will present witnesses one by one,

10 After the testimony of the witnesses,
11 the Board members at the table, I open it up for
12 questions, and then after the Board members are
13 finished asking questions of the witness, we open it
14 up to the public.

15 There will be a desire to come up and
16 state why you are in favor or opposed to the
17 application at that point, but that is not the right
18 time. It is the time to ask questions of the
19 witness. So if Mr. Matule starts with the
20 architect, the first matter of business for the
21 public will be to ask questions of the architect.

22 Everybody will have a chance to make a
23 statement at the end of all of the evidence and
24 before the deliberations to express a view on the
25 case, so I think that is really sort of the

1 procedure that we are going to follow.

2 If you have cell phones, please put
3 them on mute. Go outside if you need to have a
4 conversation, and let me turn it over to Mr. Matule.

5 MR. MATULE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

6 Good evening.

7 Robert Matule appearing on behalf of
8 the applicant.

9 Just by way of some opening background
10 and remarks, this is the application for property
11 that we are commonly referring to as 1300 Jefferson
12 Street. It is the entire block between 13th and
13 14th Street, and between Jefferson and Madison. It
14 is in the I-1 Zone.

15 We are here tonight seeking preliminary
16 site plan approval and variances to renovate and
17 enlarge the existing structures on the site into a
18 mixed-use project with 296 residential units, 443
19 parking space, and 54,000 square feet of commercial
20 space. The commercial space will consist of retail
21 and commercial recreation and office space.

22 We have several witnesses tonight. We
23 have our architect, Mr. Minervini; Mr. Kolling, our
24 planner; Mr. Staigar, our traffic engineer; Mr.
25 Chartier, our environmental engineer, who will talk

1 about the green aspects of the building, as well as
2 members of the applicant themselves.

3 The architect will talk about it in his
4 testimony, but we are going to seek to develop the
5 building in phases, three separate phases. Mr.
6 Minervini will speak to that more specifically.

7 Because we are asking for a use in the
8 I-1 Zone that is not permitted, it triggers the
9 affordable housing set aside ordinance, and as we
10 have indicated in our preliminary affidavits, the
11 project will include 30 affordable units as required
12 by the ordinance, assuming the Board sees its way
13 fit to give us preliminary approval when we come
14 back for final, then the more specific numbers and
15 unit counts and things of that nature will be
16 addressed in our more specific affordable housing
17 plan. But for purposes of satisfying the
18 preliminary checklist requirements, we are going to
19 provide 30 affordable units.

20 Also, if the Board members have looked
21 at the application, we attached to it a resolution.
22 This property was the subject of an application in
23 2010 by a previous owner. I think that was
24 primarily residential in nature, 203 units. That
25 application was denied. I believe it resulted in

1 some litigation, which was ultimately resolved when
2 the current applicant purchased the property, so
3 that is just kind of by way of background.

4 Before we get into the architectural
5 testimony, I would like to have Mr. Villamar, who is
6 one of the principals of the applicant, come up and
7 be sworn and just give the Board some background
8 information about how long they owned the site, how
9 it is currently used and sort of how this plan has
10 evolved into what we currently have before you.

11 So on that note, Mr. Villamar?

12 MR. GALVIN: Raise your right hand,
13 please.

14 Do you swear to tell the truth, the
15 whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you
16 God?

17 MR. VILLAMAR: I do.

18 M A R K L U I S V I L L A M A R, having been
19 duly sworn, testified as follows:

20 MR. GALVIN: State your full name for
21 the record and spell your last name.

22 MR. VILLAMAR: Mark Luis Villamar,
23 V-i- double l-a-m-a-r.

24 MR. GALVIN: Your witness, Mr. Matule.

25 MR. MATULE: Thank you, Mr. Galvin.

1 Mr. Villamar, you are one of the
2 principals of the applicant LLC?

3 THE WITNESS: Yes, I am.

4 MR. MATULE: And just for the record,
5 that is Just Block 112, LLC?

6 THE WITNESS: Correct.

7 MR. MATULE: How long has Just Block,
8 LLC owned the property?

9 THE WITNESS: We purchased the property
10 December 12th, 2012.

11 MR. MATULE: And how is the property
12 currently used?

13 THE WITNESS: When we purchased, it was
14 a vacant building, somewhat in need of repair. We
15 turned it into a temporary parking facility.

16 MR. MATULE: And that is currently
17 being used for parking?

18 THE WITNESS: Correct.

19 MR. MATULE: And the plan that is
20 presently before the Board, could you just, you
21 know, talk to the Board in the context of how the
22 plan evolved to be the mixed-use residential and
23 commercial recreational plan that is before them?

24 THE WITNESS: Our particular focus as a
25 company is to do a true mixed-use development.

1 Sometimes it may be in a smaller setting, but in
2 this case we have a residential with affordable
3 housing with live-work components and with market
4 rate housing.

5 We have recreational activities that
6 are going to be right opposite the under Viaduct
7 recreational area that the county is providing, and
8 we have commercial for small businesses.

9 Our previous project that is coming out
10 of the ground at this point, if 1414 Grand Street is
11 another example of our kind of vision for this area,
12 it includes live-work units, retail and commercial.

13 Previous to that, we did an all
14 commercial building, which houses the Beer Garden at
15 1422 Grand Street.

16 MR. MATULE: And the large commercial
17 spaces, they are being proposed for recreational
18 uses, do you have specific end-users lined up for
19 them, and if you do, what kind of uses are we
20 talking about?

21 THE WITNESS: We have two uses. The
22 one on the north end would occupy 21,000 square feet
23 of the existing building, which although it doesn't
24 look particularly attractive now, it is a cladding
25 of sheet metal.

1 Inside is a very intricate structure
2 that has very wide column widths and would lend
3 itself very well to a bowling alley, and we are
4 currently discussing final arrangements for the
5 bowling operation for the south -- for the north end
6 of the facility, 21,000 feet.

7 On the south end, we are going to use
8 the existing building for a rock climbing gym, and
9 we have another operator who has a number of similar
10 units in New Jersey. The operation is Gravity
11 Vault.

12 MR. MATULE: They would be using this
13 outside?

14 THE WITNESS: The 15,000 feet at the
15 south end of the building.

16 MR. MATULE: Then in the center of the
17 site would be the residential component, primarily
18 residential component?

19 THE WITNESS: Primarily, but on the
20 street level, we would have retail. We would have
21 some commercial above the retail, and then the
22 residential component above that.

23 MR. MATULE: Is there anything else
24 that you would like to add just in terms about how
25 the plan evolved from industrial to mixed use?

1 THE WITNESS: Well, as our other
2 buildings are also in the I-1 Zone, we obviously
3 need variances of use in order to do what we plan to
4 do.

5 We looked at this building as something
6 different than the previous owner. The previous
7 owner was going to demolish it and build a typical
8 donut-shaped building, four stories over parking
9 with small retail on the corners.

10 Our idea was to put as much of the
11 building as we can possibly use, which is about 45
12 percent of the existing structure, and keep the
13 residential vertical rather than horizontal, and I
14 think we came up with a good plan for that.

15 MR. MATULE: I have no further
16 questions unless the Board members have any
17 questions.

18 MR. GALVIN: You were talking about the
19 case that went to court?

20 MR. MATULE: Oh, yes, yes.

21 MR. GALVIN: Block 112?

22 MR. MATULE: Yes.

23 MR. GALVIN: I wanted to correct it. I
24 am sure you thought it was a donut hole property,
25 but it was really not. It was really solid. The

1 donut hole was on the outside.

2 MR. MATULE: The case that is the
3 subject of the application of denial that is
4 attached --

5 MR. GALVIN: Yes. I don't expect that
6 you have to look at it, and I don't expect you would
7 have to know about it, but you made a comment, and I
8 just wanted to clarify that it wasn't a typical
9 plan. It was a big plan, and it didn't have a donut
10 hole.

11 (Laughter)

12 MR. MATULE: Thank you.

13 That is a denial. Thank you.

14 Okay. Well, then I will ask Mr.
15 Minervini to come up.

16 MR. GALVIN: Could you stop for one
17 second?

18 You guys have to try to find a seat, if
19 you can.

20 I see a couple, so you are going to
21 have to take them even if they are in the front row.

22 MR. MATULE: Mr. Minervini.

23 MR. GALVIN: Glad to see you. Glad you
24 could make it.

25 Raise your right hand.

1 Do you swear to tell the truth, the
2 whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you
3 God?

4 MR. MINERVINI: Yes, I do.

5 F R A N K M I N E R V I N I, having been duly
6 sworn, testified as follows:

7 MR. GALVIN: State your full name for
8 the record and spell your last name.

9 THE WITNESS: Frank Minervini,
10 M-i-n-e-r-v-i-n-i.

11 MR. GALVIN: Mr. Chairman, do we accept
12 Mr. Minervini's credentials?

13 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Yes, we do.

14 MR. MATULE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

15 Mr. Minervini, as always, if you are
16 going to refer to exhibits, we need to mark them.

17 THE WITNESS: Yes.

18 MR. MATULE: I guess we will start
19 obviously from A-1 and go alphabetically through.

20 So when you are testifying, if there is
21 something specific that you know you are going --
22 are you going to use that board that you have in
23 your hand right now?

24 THE WITNESS: I am going to use this
25 photo board.

1 MR. MATULE: Okay. So why don't we
2 mark the photo board A-1.

3 (Exhibit A-1 marked.)

4 Could you just describe for the record
5 what it is and who took the photos and how current
6 they are?

7 THE WITNESS: These are photographs
8 taken by my office probably within the last four
9 months. I can tell that just by the amount of
10 construction done to the bridge reflecting the
11 existing conditions of the site in context.

12 MR. MATULE: Perfect.

13 All right. Would you describe the
14 existing site and the surrounding area?

15 THE WITNESS: As Mister -- as Mark
16 Villamar already mentioned, and I probably will
17 repeat some of the things that he said, our site is
18 an 80,000 square foot side, Block 112, which is the
19 entire block between 13th Street and 14th Street on
20 the south and north, and between Madison Street on
21 the west and Jefferson on the east.

22 On the northern portion of the
23 building, we abut the Viaduct and the new
24 construction.

25 Essentially the building as it exists,

1 although connected, were three separate buildings.
2 So we got a building shown here in the red, which is
3 the building to our north. This would be 14th
4 Street. This is the Viaduct above.

5 The building to the south, this is
6 Jefferson Street. This is 13th Street, and the
7 center portion of the building, which would be shown
8 here. That is important because it directly
9 affected the design of our building.

10 We knew, as one of the property owners,
11 something they really wanted to introduce here was a
12 bowling alley, as well as some other recreation, but
13 I will start with the bowling alley.

14 Looking at the property, the existing
15 building to the north, because of its previous use
16 and 60-foot span between columns, would actually
17 suit itself very well for a bowling use.

18 So with that in mind, this section of
19 the building, which was about 22,000 square feet --
20 when I say "the building," I mean the entire
21 block -- we are going to design, and it is on our
22 drawings, and I will discuss it in more detail, a
23 bowling alley and music venue, so that is the
24 building to the north.

25 The facades are going to change, but

1 the main structure of the building and the parts
2 that we really want to use in terms of its adaptive
3 reuse are going to remain.

4 MS. BANYRA: Excuse me, Mr. Minervini.

5 Did you say a bowling alley and a music
6 venue?

7 THE WITNESS: It is a music venue
8 within the bowling alley, and we'll discuss that.

9 MS. BANYRA: Okay.

10 THE WITNESS: I will get to that in
11 more detail.

12 To the south, where this parking sign
13 is, there is commercial space, and I will show you
14 on the renderings, but as Mark had already
15 mentioned, the Gravity Vault, which is a rock
16 climbing facility over here on the board for this
17 building, if it were to be approved, would be at
18 this corner, which would be our Madison and 13th
19 Street corner.

20 So on the two planking ends of the
21 project of the property, we have two anchors in
22 terms of recreational use.

23 The portion to the center will be two
24 buildings, a common parking garage, two residential
25 buildings coming from that. So in short, that is

1 our building, as you can see in the photographs.

2 In terms of context, across Madison
3 Street on 13th Street, this is another industrial
4 building that is not being used. These are various
5 shots around the neighborhood.

6 The building is within the I-1 Zone,
7 and almost all of the buildings that are there now
8 are industrial use.

9 We do border on the Northwest
10 Redevelopment Zone, but the majority of the
11 buildings there, as they exist, are industrial use,
12 and some -- most not even being used for that.

13 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Can I slow you down,
14 Mr. Minervini?

15 THE WITNESS: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Is that going to be
17 marked as an exhibit?

18 THE WITNESS: A-1.

19 MR. MATULE: Well, what I was going to
20 suggest when Frank finished -- took a break was that
21 we can either mark the other side A-2, or we can
22 call A-1 a two-sided --

23 MR. GALVIN: No. Let's make it -- it
24 is a detachable, let's make it A-2.

25 MR. MATULE: Okay.

1 (Exhibit A-2 marked.)

2 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: And I guess I would
3 like to know is what are we looking at.

4 MR. MATULE: Okay. Why don't you just
5 again --

6 THE WITNESS: On A-2 specifically?

7 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Yes, please.

8 THE WITNESS: These are various
9 photographs of around the neighborhood, and each one
10 is described.

11 So this photograph, for example, is the
12 intersection of 13th and Adams.

13 This is a building on Jefferson between
14 14th and 13th, it was a foundry, and it was the
15 subject of a project in front of this Board a couple
16 of weeks ago.

17 Another building, which would be the
18 other corner of this, which is a residential
19 building at the border of the Northwest
20 Redevelopment Zone, within the Northwest
21 Redevelopment zone.

22 This is Madison Street. This is a
23 building, which is the entire block, an industrial
24 use, one-story building directly to our west.

25 This is an empty lot, which as part of

1 the western edge plan and was perhaps to be a public
2 parking area -- I mean a public park, but now it is
3 no use at all. It is empty.

4 This is a commercial building that
5 houses a restaurant and a couple of other retail
6 spaces.

7 This as well is across Madison Street
8 to the west.

9 So these are various shots, and I will
10 be happy to hand them up and pass it around, if you
11 want to look at it more closely.

12 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: That is okay.

13 Board members?

14 (Board members confer.)

15 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Well, while I am on a
16 break, I hate to see anybody standing. There are a
17 couple of steps here, if people want to sit on the
18 step or against the wall.

19 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: I am comfortable
20 standing.

21 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay. Thank you.

22 Go ahead, sorry.

23 THE WITNESS: This truly is a mixed-use
24 building. I know this Board has often seen a
25 majority of residential buildings with some small

1 commercial spaces in the corners that could be used
2 for something else.

3 This building is truly a mixed-use
4 building with 54,000 square feet of its area -- of
5 its floor area going directly towards commercial, so
6 that includes the bowling alley on the north.

7 That includes the rock climbing gym on
8 the south, as well as - and I will get to them when
9 I get into the plan - various other commercial
10 spaces that go from Madison, on 14th Street, as well
11 as Jefferson and 13th Street, so all four sides at
12 ground level of the building are commercial.

13 The residential component of the
14 building that has been mentioned, I will probably
15 start with this, with renderings, if I can find the
16 appropriate one.

17 So this rendering would have to be
18 marked A-3.

19 MR. MATULE: I will mark this rendering
20 A-3.

21 (Exhibit A-3 marked.)

22 Just describe what it is.

23 THE WITNESS: These are four schematic
24 renderings, and I have more detailed renderings,
25 showing the building in context with the adjacent

1 properties and the Viaduct and the Palisades.
2 Again, this will go to the context, kind of related
3 to my last board.

4 So as mentioned, this is our proposed
5 building, the bowling alley on the north end, the
6 commercial space, as well as the Gravity Vault on
7 the south end, the 14th Street Viaduct, which
8 construction is finishing soon, and the Palisades
9 behind us.

10 This property across Jefferson Street
11 to the east was the subject of a zoning application
12 a couple of weeks ago.

13 This parcel here is a one-story
14 commercial building that I mentioned that has a
15 restaurant, a day care center, as well as a fitness
16 gym. That is a one-story.

17 This is an empty lot, where the city as
18 part of the Western Redevelopment Plan, was going to
19 be a recreation -- an outdoor recreation area, as
20 well as the old Cognis site, the chemical company,
21 which is owned I guess now by BASF. So this drawing
22 shows the proposed recreation slash park space
23 relative to where our building is.

24 So these all play on that theme,
25 showing the building, giving the surrounding area.

1 This side of Jefferson Street are the buildings for
2 residential use within the Northwest Redevelopment
3 Zone.

4 As Mr. Villamar mentioned, these are
5 buildings that are five above parking, residential
6 buildings, shaped like a donut with an opening
7 between.

8 The reason I pointed that out
9 specifically is because of the adaptive reuse of our
10 property, because of the need and the want to have
11 recreation space, the design of our building evolved
12 in a different direction.

13 Instead of having the standard again
14 Northwest Redevelopment Plan, which is six stories,
15 five residential over parking, I think it is 60
16 percent lot coverage we are permitted on the
17 residential floors above. On the ground floor it's
18 90 percent.

19 What this does is make for a very
20 simple rather uninteresting street scape. We chose
21 to use as part of this proposal similar volume, but
22 turn it on its side.

23 So where on this building, you have 65
24 percent lot coverage, on the residential floors of
25 our building we are at 35 percent lot coverage, so

1 the thinking there is although taller, and the
2 building is 13 stories, although taller, it is less
3 lot coverage.

4 We also thought that this part of town
5 could absolutely accommodate it, and the plan will
6 speak more to that, certainly can accommodate the
7 taller building.

8 Understanding that a taller building
9 will have a bit more visual impact, we designed the
10 building, and I have got three renderings that will
11 speak to that. Just with the use of architecture,
12 we think, and this is another board, Mr. Matule --

13 MR. MATULE: This is A-4.

14 (Exhibit A-4 marked.

15 THE WITNESS: -- and this is a computer
16 generated rendering of the building looking from
17 east to west with Union City -- and Jersey City
18 excuse me -- with the eclipse behind us.

19 So what we have done with this building
20 is we have turned what the residential component
21 would have been, could have been, just as a solid
22 block along this portion of the building and turned
23 it into two sections of the building coming up and
24 its full height of 13 stories.

25 The reason again for that is it allowed

1 us to keep the two adaptive reuse components, which
2 will become recreational, assuming approval, the
3 bowling alley on the north again, the commercial
4 space, as well as the rock climbing gym on the
5 south, and it also allowed us to have 40 percent
6 less lot coverage, where as 60 or 65 percent would
7 have been the standard in the residential, we are
8 proposing now on these upper floors 35 percent.

9 I will go through all of the lot
10 coverage as I get to the plans. But in terms of the
11 visual impact of the height, we use some
12 architectural nuances that we think reduce the
13 visual mass of the building.

14 One is we have introduced angle lines
15 here, which by varying from the rectangular, will
16 more match the mountains, as you call it cliffs, and
17 I know it is not a mountain, the cliffs behind it.

18 But more importantly is that we grouped
19 floor sections into two. So what normally would be
20 a floor level, a floor level, multiplied by 13
21 times, we grouped them into three at the top of the
22 building and two elsewhere, and the visual impact we
23 think certainly has been lessened with that design
24 idea.

25 While I got this here, we can talk

1 about what is on Jefferson Street. Jefferson
2 Street, this commercial component of the building
3 here, the entry to the bowling alley here, and the
4 two residential entries along Jefferson, and there's
5 two residential entries along Madison, and again,
6 the plans will speak to that in more detail.

7 Another view of the same --

8 MR. MATULE: Mark this A-5.

9 (Exhibit A-5 marked.)

10 THE WITNESS: -- a different
11 perspective, this would be the corner. This would
12 be our southeast corner, where there is a cafe
13 proposed. You have the Gravity Vault rock climbing
14 gym here. What we have done is we are reusing the
15 structure here and adding one floor.

16 This section of the building is not
17 changing at all, which is where the bowling alley
18 is, so that is another view of the building.

19 In context, directly to our west is the
20 Yardley building in Union City, which as I recall
21 has two 28-story buildings approved as part of the
22 redevelopment plan, not yet built, of course.

23 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Can you say what
24 you just said again?

25 THE WITNESS: Two 28 stories as part of

1 it, not Hoboken, Union City, a redevelopment plan
2 that has yet to be acted upon, where the Yardley
3 building is.

4 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Yardley building?

5 THE WITNESS: Yes.

6 Again, I only say that for context. It
7 has not been built, and I'm not suggesting that it
8 will be built necessarily.

9 MR. MATULE: Another rendering?

10 THE WITNESS: Another rendering.

11 MR. MATULE: A-6.

12 (Exhibit A-6 marked.)

13 THE WITNESS: A-6.

14 The purpose of this rendering is to --
15 we are focusing here on the recreational component,
16 in this case the bowling alley. We are calling it
17 Hoboken Bowl. One of the owners -- developers will
18 speak to this in more detail, but the thinking here
19 is it will be a bowling alley, as well as a small
20 scale music venue, very similar to a very popular
21 establishment, Brooklyn Bowl in Brooklyn.

22 With that in mind, and because this
23 will be a pedestrian -- although it is shown with a
24 car -- the reality is now that the Viaduct
25 construction is being finished, this will be a --

1 let me think -- is this pedestrian -- yes. This
2 section of the Viaduct is all pedestrian walkway.
3 There's no cars permitted, so we introduced as a
4 revision, and I will speak to that, commercial space
5 along here.

6 So there is small scale commercial
7 space meant to feed whatever park, whatever
8 recreational area would be used for underneath the
9 Viaduct.

10 The reason I tell you that is because
11 the building we were trying to -- we had tried to
12 with the design to be sensitive to what is coming,
13 and the Viaduct is a huge project, and the
14 ramifications will be huge in terms of the
15 recreational space that will be there, so the
16 commercial space that we are proposing will serve
17 any recreational uses.

18 I will go through the floor plans now.

19 You know what?

20 I will actually -- I'll go through the
21 floor plans, but I will give a quick breakdown of
22 what we are proposing in terms of the building and
23 its residential component.

24 As I mentioned, we've got 54,000 square
25 feet of combined nonresidential use, so that would

1 be the recreational use. That would be the cafe and
2 any commercial use they are proposing.

3 We are proposing 296 residential units.
4 Of those 296, 46 will be three-bedroom apartments.
5 160 will be two-bedroom apartments. 90 will be
6 one-bedroom apartments. Sheet Z-5 has a detailed
7 breakdown, if you want to look at it.

8 As Mr. Matule mentioned, we will be and
9 are required to provide 30 affordable housing units.
10 We have yet to determine exactly which apartments
11 they will be. They will be done, assuming approval,
12 prior to final site plan approval.

13 We are also proposing 26 live-work
14 spaces. I will get to that in the floor plans, but
15 on our third floor, which is the first residential
16 floor, we have spaces with tall ceilings, that
17 mezzanine, a third floor residential use, as well as
18 the live-work, and a mezzanine, and the thinking
19 there is that a true live-work apartment will have a
20 segregation between the living quarters and whatever
21 is going to go on below it.

22 It is mentioned many times in the
23 master plan. Mr. Kolling will speak to that in more
24 detail. It was something that the city had wanted
25 on the northern section of the Viaduct in the urban

1 economic development zone. I know that because I
2 have a building there. And with that design comes a
3 flexible floor plan, a segregation of the sleeping
4 area, as well as larger doors, and the thinking is
5 if somebody wants to have a home office, it is very
6 easy to do.

7 If somebody wants to have a small art
8 studio, it is very easy to do, and apparently it is
9 something that the city wants. So with that in
10 mind, 26 of these apartments on the third floor will
11 be apportioned to live-work.

12 So the floor plans, I have to mention a
13 discrepancy in the floor plans as you see them.
14 There was a late drafting revision, which added
15 retail space along the 14th Street corridor section.

16 Several of the drawings that you have
17 don't reflect that, so you have one drawing showing
18 this revision, and the others show it as parking.

19 The calculations are all correct. The
20 reason that we kept the other drawings in is simply
21 because all of the topographic and other utility
22 information didn't change.

23 So although all of that technical
24 information remains the same on the floor plan, the
25 revision of adding that retail space that I

1 mentioned along 14th Street, which is a pedestrian
2 section of 14th Street and will service the under
3 bridge recreation area.

4 So with that in mind, I will go through
5 some of the floor plans.

6 MS. BANYRA: Mr. Minervini, is that
7 included or above the 54,000 square feet?

8 THE WITNESS: That is included.

9 The parking is correct, just that there
10 was a drafting error, that it didn't get applied to
11 the other technical plans.

12 We talked about the building context.
13 Here is the entire block, Block 112, 13th Street,
14 Jefferson Street, Madison Street, 14th and the
15 Viaduct above.

16 Sheet Z-2 is a survey of the property
17 as it exists.

18 I am going to hop over to Sheet Z-6 --
19 Z-6A, so this is our first floor plan, partially at
20 grade,

21 Jefferson Street, we have two
22 residential entries, one here and one here, and this
23 is a lower section of a two-story commercial space
24 along Jefferson.

25 The same applies to Madison. This is a

1 lower section of the commercial space that is two
2 stories along Madison, another residential entry,
3 and here and here, so the building has four
4 residential entries.

5 The lower section of what would be the
6 bowling alley is parking, and I will go through all
7 of the ingress and egress.

8 As I mentioned before, this swath of
9 property of space along 14th Street now will be
10 dedicated to small scale retail.

11 The existing building on the south, we
12 are converting this lower space into parking, as
13 well as a lobby for the retail space above.

14 So vehicles, vehicles enter the main
15 parking area here along Madison. They enter the
16 second floor of the parking here along Madison on
17 the northern edge of the property. There is also a
18 vehicular entry along at the corner section of 14th
19 and Madison here, so if you enter the parking here,
20 you can park specifically for the bowling alley, or
21 you can enter the whole main section.

22 This is all park your own, so to speak.
23 This is all self-park. This ground level is
24 self-park, so this section, this entry is a ramp
25 entry that takes you to the second floor parking.

1 I should also mention that we provided
2 loading bays. The garage doors are quite tall, and
3 trucks could come in with the proper approval from
4 the concierge, and we have two loading bays to keep
5 that off the street.

6 Sheet Z-7 takes us to what would be the
7 second floor. So this section is the second floor
8 commercial space along Jefferson. This swath is the
9 second floor commercial space along Madison. This
10 is -- we keep mentioning the rock climbing gym, and
11 these are three possible smaller commercial spaces
12 or one combined larger one depending on who the end
13 user might be.

14 The ramp entry into these 289 parking
15 spaces, these are all stacked. They're triple
16 stacked. I got a section drawing describing it. We
17 worked closely with a company called Park Plus.
18 They manufacture this exact product. So all of this
19 is valet parking, no end user. No resident will
20 ever actually park their car here. That would be
21 cued here or cued along the ramp.

22 So when I get to the section drawings,
23 you will get a better sense of the volumes within
24 the building.

25 But 289 of our parking spaces -- I'm

1 sorry -- 288 of our parking spaces are all served
2 with a triple level mechanical parking system.

3 This is the bowling alley. We have not
4 finished the design yet. Of course, if this were
5 approved, a finished design would be shown. But
6 given our size and including a small stage for
7 music, we can fit 16 to 18 bowling alleys, as well
8 as a stage large enough to get some decent side
9 acts, and that is the thinking.

10 I did mention, and it will be mentioned
11 several times, that last Tuesday we had a
12 neighborhood meeting, and we tried to explain the
13 project to anyone who was interested in coming from
14 the neighborhood. And what I took out of that
15 meeting was that the music venue was much more
16 important than I had expected it to be, so
17 apparently the people in the neighborhood really
18 like the idea of a combined music and bowling venue.

19 Nevertheless, Sheet Z-8, which is our
20 third floor and the first residential floor, so this
21 section of the building is U-shaped with the void or
22 opening towards -- directly towards the east.

23 These are the 26 spaces that will all
24 be live-work. There are many different sizes.

25 The hatched area shows a mezzanine

1 space. So what we have done is we have doubled the
2 floor height, the volume within the space, proposed
3 mezzanines of about a third of the overall
4 footprint, and those will be dedicated to the
5 live-work units as I discussed previously.

6 The roof of the parking will be a
7 common outdoor space. I think the Board may have
8 seen this. It is -- I will save this. Actually
9 I'll save this. I have renderings from our
10 landscape architect who did come up with this
11 design, but I will save it for later.

12 So this floor, floor three, is all of
13 the live-work units, as well as some spaces meant
14 just for the building's occupants. You have common
15 rooms. You've got gymnasiums. Those spaces will be
16 meant to serve any of the residents of the building.

17 The roof of the commercial area,
18 commercial spaces, would be partially above the rock
19 climbing gym, partially above the three possible
20 commercial spaces on the southeast. That is going
21 to be an outdoor terrace also meant to be used by
22 all of the occupants. So if you live in the
23 building, you got this outdoor space as well as this
24 outdoor space trying to take advantage of any roof
25 spaces.

1 Floors four through seven, these are
2 residential spaces. I have already given you a
3 breakdown.

4 What is different from this plan
5 relative to the renderings and elevations that you
6 got is that the balconies have been removed. Other
7 than that, this is an accurate plan. Again, this is
8 U-shaped, so floors four through seven are U-shaped
9 with a section of the building along Madison Street.

10 Now, we get through floors eight
11 through thirteen, and Sheet Z-10, we're calling to
12 propose an eighth floor, but again, more outdoor
13 space, a landscaped common area at the roof of this
14 section. Now the building becomes two separate
15 residential components.

16 I'm going to go back to the
17 rendering -- a rendering. It is clearly shown here.
18 So residential component, residential component.
19 This is 13 stories, so you are looking at this roof
20 would be this roof, and these two buildings are
21 these two buildings.

22 The floors nine, ten, and eleven, and
23 thirteen, these are different because there is no
24 longer that connection.

25 Sheet Z-12 is the -- is separate

1 because it shows our twelfth floor plan, our next to
2 last floor plan, again, a similar idea as the
3 live-work, we have created a double height volume
4 for an apartment with a mezzanine space. So this
5 allows for a separation again of the sleeping area
6 within the apartment and a very voluminous
7 residential space below, so that is the next to the
8 last.

9 The roof of the two residential
10 components, here and here, we are proposing to be
11 private roof decks with common access, so we have
12 access going to the stair halls and elevator, each
13 of these private roof decks which will be accessed
14 within from a common area, but will have their own
15 private use.

16 Sheet Z-14 shows elevations of the
17 existing additions of the building. So if we look
18 at it, it is our Jefferson Street elevation. This
19 building is where we are proposing the bowling alley
20 to be.

21 This section is where the commercial
22 space is, as well as behind it would be the rock
23 climbing gym.

24 This center section, which now has
25 temporary parking, would be the two residential

1 components, here and here.

2 I already described the elevations, but
3 in terms of the street scape, this is our 14th
4 Street elevation. So imagine this is looking at the
5 Viaduct. This is the recent revisions I discussed,
6 which will be all small scale commercial spaces,
7 meant to serve whatever recreation is going to
8 happen beneath the Viaduct.

9 This is the facade, which faces the
10 south, a cafe on the corner, and Gravity Vault here
11 and here.

12 Obviously we are thinking of calling
13 this Hoboken Bowl. As I mentioned Brooklyn Bowl,
14 which is a very successful --

15 MR. GALVIN: You kind of said that
16 already.

17 THE WITNESS: "Successful"?

18 MR. GALVIN: No. You mentioned the
19 Brooklyn Bowl. That is the second time.

20 THE WITNESS: I might mention it again
21 as well, so...

22 MR. GALVIN: I will point it out then,
23 too.

24 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: I didn't hear him
25 the first time, so --

1 MR. GALVIN: Well, I'm glad you heard
2 him now.

3 THE WITNESS: So these were elevations
4 from the other views, and you have seen most of this
5 from the renderings.

6 Sheet Z-18-A: The partial section to
7 the building, and I think this is important because
8 as I described it before, for the parking.

9 So the main portion of the parking, the
10 self-parking area, is slightly below grade here at
11 the center of the building.

12 Above that we have a three-tiered
13 mechanical parking system, so this is all valet
14 parking.

15 This is self-parking. This section is
16 the lower portion of the commercial space, a
17 connective upper portion of commercial space. The
18 same for this size. This would be Jefferson, and
19 this would be Madison.

20 A section taken the other way, again,
21 showing three tiers of parking. All of the
22 dimensions that we got shown, or the number of
23 parking spaces was all based on dealing with
24 consultants with a particular company called Park
25 Plus, who will be eventually providing this system.

1 If approved, if the Board is so inclined, at final
2 site plan approval, we could have, you know, one of
3 the consultants come in to speak to this
4 specifically.

5 MS. BANYRA: Excuse me.

6 Mr. Minervini, that is floors one and
7 two, correct? It's just a tall second floor?

8 THE WITNESS: Correct, correct, and
9 this would be our third floor, the first residential
10 floor, which is the third floor.

11 MS. BANYRA: Okay.

12 THE WITNESS: Again, a section taken
13 longitudinal. That's our longitudinal section.

14 Tom Chartier, our green energy
15 engineer, will speak to in more detail what we are
16 proposing. But quickly, we are proposing a LEED
17 gold certified building. He will speak to the
18 components, but they are substantial, cogeneration.
19 He will go through the other requirements, other
20 proposals.

21 In terms of parking count, we are
22 required, given the commercial space of 54,000
23 square feet as well as the 289 apartments, to
24 provide 431 parking spaces. We are proposing 443
25 parking spaces. 289 of those are mechanical.

1 And in conclusion, this building and
2 its orientation and its configuration, and its
3 height and everything about it is really generated
4 from the idea of keeping of the two larger
5 components, existing buildings, which will be
6 adaptively reused on the north and south for a
7 recreational area.

8 I did forget one thing.

9 We did generate just for comparison --

10 MR. MATULE: This is A-7.

11 (Exhibit A-7 marked.)

12 THE WITNESS: -- A-7, another
13 rendering, and that would be these two specific
14 renderings of what could be build in accordance with
15 the I-1 requirements.

16 Still it is an 80-foot building at 65
17 percent lot coverage. That is what it would look
18 like just for comparison.

19 These two renderings were given to us
20 by our landscape architect with an idea of what
21 these two outdoor spaces would look like.

22 On the other side, Mr. Matule.

23 MR. MATULE: A-8.

24 (Exhibit A-8 marked.)

25 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Frank, you'd make

1 them look nicer, though, than just the white? I
2 mean, outside in the back --

3 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. I will go
4 back to that in a second.

5 This is what could be built. And would
6 somebody make it look better?

7 It's an industrial building. I don't
8 know. I understand your question, though.

9 Here are some images of what the
10 Gravity Vault spaces would be like. It is rock
11 climbing and a lot of us have a sense of what rock
12 climbing is, even if we may not have done it, but it
13 is very popular and well received.

14 These are photographs of, I won't say
15 the establishment in Brooklyn, but it is a bowling
16 alley and a music venue.

17 (Laughter)

18 MR. GALVIN: But at least you said it
19 in a different context.

20 THE WITNESS: Yes.

21 MR. MATULE: If you would, you
22 mentioned, and I had mentioned at the outset that
23 assuming this project were approved, it would be
24 constructed in phases. Could you just briefly
25 address that?

1 THE WITNESS: Yes.

2 The plan would be: Phase I would be
3 the bowling alley slash music venue, which we would
4 be reusing the existing structure adding some space,
5 adding a floor level within it, which in essence
6 would be relocating the existing floor slab up to
7 above base flood elevation, so everything that is on
8 the bowling alley, everything is above flood level.
9 That is Phase I.

10 Phase II would be the southern portion
11 of the building, including the Gravity Vault and
12 these other commercial spaces we are showing.

13 Last would be the residential
14 components.

15 MR. MATULE: Okay.

16 THE WITNESS: I should mention that the
17 building will be noncombustible, of course, ADA
18 compliant, as well as sprinklered, and that is it.
19 That is a good requirement to have, of course, but
20 this building will have it.

21 MR. MATULE: Okay. I have no further
22 questions.

23 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Before I open it up,
24 do you have a rendering that reflects -- I'm
25 sorry --

1 MR. MATULE: I'm sorry, Mr. Chair.

2 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: -- do you have a
3 rendering that reflects a view from the south from
4 the park looking north?

5 THE WITNESS: From the park looking
6 towards the north?

7 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Yes.

8 THE WITNESS: Yes, I do. That would be
9 this one.

10 So this would be the southeast corner.

11 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: So what we are looking
12 at is a thirteen-story, 200 --

13 THE WITNESS: Behind it.

14 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: -- 200 foot wide
15 building?

16 THE WITNESS: Well, yes, from side to
17 side, correct, yes. I'm sorry.

18 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay. All right.

19 Let me open it up to the Board members.

20 Anybody want to start off with Mr.
21 Minervini?

22 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Sure.

23 Tiffanie, do you want to start?

24 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Well, I -- I
25 have some technical questions.

1 First on the parking, I have two
2 questions around the parking garage.

3 One, as you know, I am always concerned
4 about loading.

5 Can you tell me a little bit about
6 these loading bays --

7 THE WITNESS: Yes.

8 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- and what -- as
9 I use as an example at a lot of meetings, I live in
10 the Tea Building with 500 people. We have 200
11 moving vans, moving giant trucks per year. 20
12 percent of the building turns every year. So for
13 us, we don't have a loading zone, so when I look at
14 things like this --

15 THE WITNESS: Understood.

16 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- I think 20
17 percent of 300 is 60 giant moving trucks every year
18 essentially.

19 THE WITNESS: Well, I remember that
20 comment, of course.

21 COMMISSIONER FISHER: I know. I'm
22 telling the large audience that hasn't heard it
23 before.

24 THE WITNESS: Yes. And with that in
25 mind, well, two things after your comments in that

1 meeting, I looked a bit into, and we can petition
2 the city, although not shown here, we can petition
3 the city for loading zones in the front.

4 I mentioned that specifically because a
5 good portion of this front of the building now is
6 all cut curb already, so that is something that we
7 can petition for. It's not included in this plan
8 because I can't speak to it as a fact.

9 What we have provided are loading bays,
10 two -- two trucks, two box trucks could be in this
11 location and this location. One towards the south
12 end of the building, and one towards the north end.

13 They could enter either through this
14 vehicular ingress/egress or this one. It would have
15 to be coordinated with any concierge that the
16 building has, but we got the space for four loading
17 docks -- loading trucks.

18 COMMISSIONER FISHER: And those are the
19 big ones, too, or just like --

20 THE WITNESS: A box truck, yes, the big
21 ones. It is not a trailer -- a tractor and a
22 trailer.

23 COMMISSIONER FISHER: My second
24 question then is the stacking parking.

25 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.

1 COMMISSIONER FISHER: It seems -- I'm
2 sorry -- it seems like -- how is that exactly going
3 to work?

4 It just seems like a lot. You said it
5 is triple stacked?

6 THE WITNESS: Yes.

7 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Is it two deep?

8 THE WITNESS: Two deep.

9 COMMISSIONER FISHER: It has how many
10 on the -- how many parking spots?

11 THE WITNESS: 288 would be using the
12 mechanical system.

13 COMMISSIONER FISHER: So how does that
14 work during, you know, the morning commutes?

15 I mean, I've seen the triple
16 stacking --

17 MS. BANYRA: The busy times.

18 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- yeah, the
19 busy times. I've seen the triple stacking, I just
20 have never seen so much of it enclosed, but
21 that's --

22 THE WITNESS: As I have come to learn
23 from dealing with the consultants, the way it works
24 is you call ahead for your car. Your car will then
25 be ready at the time you need it.

1 If you don't know the time, and you
2 ask, it will take slightly longer. But generally
3 speaking, you call ahead for your car.

4 Now, we have not yet figured out how to
5 apportion these relative to self-park downstairs.
6 My guess, and Mr. Staigar can speak to this in more
7 detail, but self-park will be more for the
8 commercial component, which will be more
9 transitional, whereas this won't be.

10 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Or you may end up
11 just valeting the whole thing.

12 THE WITNESS: This will all be valet
13 for sure.

14 COMMISSIONER FISHER: No. I'm saying
15 you may just decide to valet the whole thing.

16 THE WITNESS: It wasn't part of the
17 plan at this point, and it wasn't any part of our
18 discussion, but I guess that is possible.

19 COMMISSIONER FISHER: My other question
20 is the -- I think the number of three-bedrooms in
21 the whole development, is it 43?

22 THE WITNESS: 46.

23 COMMISSIONER FISHER: 46.

24 So 26 of those are the live-work units?

25 THE WITNESS: Live-work, I don't think

1 are all three-bedrooms.

2 COMMISSIONER FISHER: I thought you
3 said they were -- it looks like they are all
4 three-bedrooms on Z-8.

5 THE WITNESS: Yes. You are correct.
6 They are all three-bedrooms.

7 COMMISSIONER FISHER: So do you
8 anticipate that -- who is the anticipated -- is
9 there a difference in anticipated tenants, or who --
10 who occupies the live-work?

11 THE WITNESS: I think the second
12 developer, owner of the property, who would like to
13 speak at the end, and he could probably answer that
14 question better for you.

15 It certainly could be a family, or it
16 could be somebody with a home business, or it could
17 be somebody that wants both. There's enough room
18 there for both, but I think they could speak to that
19 in more detail than I could.

20 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Then I guess my
21 other question is just, if you could -- the height
22 relative to -- it's a no surprise question -- the
23 height relative to --

24 THE WITNESS: The Palisades.

25 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- the Via --

1 THE WITNESS: Oh, the Viaduct?

2 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- yeah, a few
3 things. The Viaduct, the Palisades and generally
4 relative to the comparable -- not comparable
5 residential -- not comparable -- but the residential
6 that is within few blocks --

7 THE WITNESS: I will start with that --

8 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- not
9 story-wise, just literally height.

10 I happened to walk up on the Viaduct
11 and look out and --

12 THE WITNESS: This is taller than the
13 Viaduct directly adjacent to it, but not by too
14 much.

15 I am trying to look for renderings
16 of -- I think the Viaduct, and I am using a
17 different rendering would be what could be built
18 here. The Viaduct at this section runs between 70
19 and 50 feet as I recall.

20 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Okay.

21 So at the 70 foot, it is -- at the 50
22 foot, it's almost three times the height of the
23 Viaduct, but at the 70 foot, it is doubled.

24 THE WITNESS: Let me confirm that.

25 As I look through the drawings, I will

1 speak to what I do know for sure is the height
2 differential to the Palisades. I know that because
3 I took a handheld GPS device and compared them
4 yesterday in preparation for this question.

5 The Palisades -- let me try and find a
6 good drawing to use -- well, the Palisades directly
7 behind us to the west, where the RV building is, at
8 its flatest point because it does range 162 feet.
9 I mentioned that I measured that with a GPS.

10 Our tallest portion I think is 157 or
11 158, and I'll confirm that.

12 As you drive north on Palisades, which
13 is the road that runs adjacent to the edge of the
14 Palisades, it goes up, so there is a differential.

15 If you go to this section, it is about
16 35 foot taller than our building. At no point here
17 is our building taller than the cliff, and I
18 confirmed that yesterday.

19 But the Viaduct, as I think as I
20 mentioned, is about accurate.

21 COMMISSIONER FISHER: I guess the -- my
22 last question just relating to the -- I guess
23 expanded view, I didn't fully appreciate that it is
24 going to be music and the bowling alley, which of
25 course, I would go and watch music there, but the --

1 THE WITNESS: That is an ancillary use
2 to the bowling alley --

3 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Yeah.

4 THE WITNESS: -- but I wanted to
5 mention it because it did seem at last week's
6 meeting that it was important to somebody --

7 COMMISSIONER FISHER: The ancillary use
8 that has very specific potential traffic to it, I
9 mean, I think if anybody ever went to Maxwell, it is
10 not just a Hoboken project -- it literally brings a
11 lot of people in from New York City, from people
12 driving in, you know, et cetera. So I am just
13 curious about what like in the -- I guess we will
14 talk about traffic when the traffic --

15 THE WITNESS: Mr. Staigar will speak to
16 that.

17 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- but as it
18 relates to the parking and just that amount of
19 people, how many of that amount of people in the
20 evenings use that space?

21 THE WITNESS: We don't know what the
22 occupancy will be yet. It hasn't yet been designed,
23 but given --

24 COMMISSIONER FISHER: You have a good
25 example in Brooklyn that is very successful, so --

1 THE WITNESS: It is, without parking.
2 But we are proposing parking, and there is a
3 difference there.

4 What we do know is that the zoning code
5 requires us to provide parking based on the area,
6 and we meet that requirement based on its use. But
7 to the specifics, Mr. Staigar can more accurately
8 speak to it than I can.

9 COMMISSIONER FISHER: I think that is
10 it for now.

11 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Thank you,
12 Mr. Greene?

13 VICE CHAIR GREENE: A few questions.

14 The 26 three-bedroom live-work spaces,
15 the mezzanine area is above and beyond the
16 three-bedrooms?

17 THE WITNESS: No, that is included.

18 VICE CHAIR GREENE: So they are
19 three-bedroom apartments?

20 THE WITNESS: Yes.

21 What we have done to facilitate the
22 idea of live-work was adding this taller volume
23 segregating the sleeping areas from not. It is not
24 a requirement, and there is no live-work definition
25 per se.

1 VICE CHAIR GREENE: So how is that
2 different from the apartments on the 13th or the
3 11th floor, the top floor?

4 THE WITNESS: Small things. Door
5 sizes, ventilation systems, things like that that
6 would, again, more easily facilitate an artist or
7 somebody with an office or studio of some sort.

8 Also, it's on the lower section of the
9 building, which would be if somebody does have a
10 client, for example, more easily gone to.

11 VICE CHAIR GREENE: The discrepancy
12 between the balconies, the intent is not to have
13 balconies, so our drawings are incorrect?

14 THE WITNESS: That's right. The intent
15 is not to have balconies.

16 The renderings as are shown here are
17 the most recent facade design.

18 VICE CHAIR GREENE: And you are going
19 to be -- the development is going to be segmented,
20 as you said, so there will be the bowling portion --

21 THE WITNESS: Bowling portion.

22 VICE CHAIR GREENE: -- the other
23 commercial space --

24 THE WITNESS: Southern portion and the
25 residential portion.

1 VICE CHAIR GREENE: -- so when the
2 bowling portion opens and the commercial portion
3 opens, where are those customers going to park?

4 THE WITNESS: There is parking beneath
5 both of those. There's parking beneath both of
6 those sections of the building.

7 VICE CHAIR GREENE: But they are going
8 to come in from the section that hasn't been built
9 yet?

10 THE WITNESS: No. Let me get to it.
11 Here --

12 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Tell me which
13 drawing you're referring to.

14 THE WITNESS: -- I'm sorry.

15 Sheet Z-6A, so the bowling section has
16 its own separate ingress and egress, and what we
17 would do is we would use this section of the
18 building, which will be under construction later on,
19 which would be our entry and exit for this.

20 So the two planking portions of the
21 building will have as part of the phasing parking
22 beneath them.

23 VICE CHAIR GREENE: And going back to
24 the relationship of the building to the Palisades,
25 so if you were standing at the edge of the Palisades

1 and looking out towards the river, towards
2 Manhattan, and you happened to be --

3 THE WITNESS: In somebody's yard you
4 would be.

5 VICE CHAIR GREENE: -- that would
6 essentially be the relationship?

7 THE WITNESS: Yes.

8 It is -- the Palisades as it exists in
9 this area, there is Palisades Avenue, which runs
10 north and south and parallel with the cliff.

11 There are properties along the eastern
12 side of Palisades Avenue, so if you are standing
13 actually looking at Hoboken, you would stand in
14 somebody's rear yard.

15 VICE CHAIR GREENE: So if I am standing
16 in my rear yard there, what am I looking at, if I
17 happen to be behind this proposed building?

18 THE WITNESS: You would be at least
19 slightly higher, more likely, because the Palisades
20 and Palisades Avenue rises as you go north, 35 feet
21 before it crests, you would be looking down at the
22 roof section.

23 VICE CHAIR GREENE: But directly behind
24 the building where it doesn't rise up 35 feet?

25 THE WITNESS: You want to know what our

1 building would be looking at you're asking?

2 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Yeah. I am
3 standing behind your building, and I'm looking
4 out --

5 THE WITNESS: Yes, okay.

6 VICE CHAIR GREENE: -- right now I have
7 essentially a non interrupted view.

8 What will my view look like if your
9 building would be there?

10 THE WITNESS: Understood.

11 Well, I can most easily show that on
12 the elevations.

13 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Frank, can you
14 also talk about the elevation of the road, because
15 that is where more people are likely going to stand,
16 not the Palisades, but what is that road --
17 Paterson -- Paterson Plank --

18 MR. MATULE: I think they call it the
19 south wing and the north wing.

20 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Yeah.

21 It is going to be lower.

22 So if you are standing on that road, if
23 you want to go walking or standing around looking
24 right into the building.

25 THE WITNESS: I will answer Mr.

1 Greene's question first.

2 I'm sorry.

3 You are asking what it is going to look
4 like at the west facing facade?

5 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Correct.

6 THE WITNESS: That will be the
7 residential -- no, pardon me -- yes, that is the
8 west facing facade.

9 This is the west facing facade, so now
10 conversely relative to the other renderings, Hoboken
11 Bowl is on the north. Gravity Vault is on the
12 south. The two 13-story residential components, as
13 well as this eight-story section, so you would be
14 looking at that facade. In terms of architecture it
15 is the same as you can see in concept as the other
16 renderings.

17 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Thank you.

18 THE WITNESS: And your question was
19 again?

20 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Not just -- I'm
21 sorry -- not just -- not just relative to the height
22 of the Palisades, but as you mentioned, those are
23 yards up there, but more from a tactical standpoint
24 the street --

25 THE WITNESS: This access road at the

1 top of the Viaduct, you can go either south -- I
2 mean, north towards Union City or south towards
3 Jersey City. You would be looking at the same
4 facade.

5 MR. GALVIN: What exhibit is that?

6 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. This is A-7.

7 MR. GALVIN: So you are looking at the
8 photo on the bottom left, and you're pointing to the
9 upper right.

10 THE WITNESS: Yes. It was meant to
11 convey what the building would be allowed --
12 permitted to be built, if they were to be an
13 industrial use. But it does nicely show the road
14 that you are speaking of. So you would be looking
15 at that same facade that I just showed Mr. Greene.

16 MS. BANYRA: Mr. Minervini, I guess the
17 bottom part of that is where would you be -- at what
18 section of that building would you be looking at?

19 THE WITNESS: Well, the top of the
20 Viaduct is between 80 and 90 feet, and this section
21 rises up, so you probably would be, this is an
22 estimate, at our ninth or tenth floors.

23 COMMISSIONER FISHER: What was -- the
24 second part of my previous question was what are the
25 heights generally of the six-story residential --

1 not the stories --

2 THE WITNESS: The only residential
3 areas in this neighborhood are a couple of blocks
4 away towards the east, which is the Northwest
5 Redevelopment Zone, and let me find a good
6 photograph to describe that.

7 This is the standard of 60 feet --

8 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Okay. So this is
9 about two and half times this?

10 THE WITNESS: This is taller and it's
11 also 40 percent lot coverage. That is how we wound
12 up here.

13 MS. BANYRA: 40 percent lot coverage on
14 the top --

15 THE WITNESS: Yes, I'm sorry. On the
16 other portions of the building.

17 I should mention, Mr. Matule just
18 reminded me, of 900 Monroe as well as I can't for
19 the life of me think of Dean's building down
20 there -- Metro Stop. That is an eight-story
21 building, so that is probably closer to us.

22 THE AUDIENCE: Ten stories.

23 THE WITNESS: Ten stories.

24 So just for context, it is not all of
25 the six-story. There is a proposal for 11 stories,

1 as well as Metro Stop, which is ten.

2 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Just a question
3 on the renderings as far as the facade.

4 THE WITNESS: Yes.

5 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: We are not
6 having projected balconies anyway.

7 What are the recesses there with the --
8 is that a balcony or --

9 THE WITNESS: It could be, but the
10 thought was more so than the balcony was a recess
11 for greenery.

12 This was, I don't want to take credit
13 for this, this was Mr. Hany Ahmad, one of the
14 developers out here, and I think it's a very good
15 one. It allows for a softened facade, a more green
16 softened facade.

17 The next question I am going to get is
18 who maintains it.

19 If the building is a condo, it's the
20 condo owner. If it's a rental, it would be part of
21 the building management.

22 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: And the
23 materials on the exterior, have they been decided
24 on?

25 THE WITNESS: These are masonry. It's

1 a concrete meant to look like a limestone in both
2 cases, and then brick at the lower sections where it
3 meets the street right here, here and here.

4 Metal panels on the existing structure
5 as well as metal panels on the better rendering,
6 this one, as well as a substantial amount of glass
7 current wall.

8 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Hey, Frank,
9 thank you.

10 My apologies in advance for my
11 allergies. My voice is a bit raspy.

12 Just following up on Owen's question
13 regarding the greenery that you have on the
14 balconies, I think it is a good idea as well, but I
15 just want to make sure that your landscape architect
16 is going to be able to talk more about that.

17 THE WITNESS: Yes. Although he has
18 been in charge of designing the larger outdoor
19 areas, he has not designed this. If this Board, as
20 Bob would say, sees fit to an approval, we would
21 have him design to the exact species and irrigation
22 systems and whatever else we need for those
23 particular areas.

24 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: It seems to be
25 a pretty pivotal element of the facade, if you will,

1 where these manmade pieces are interjected by
2 greenery.

3 THE WITNESS: Yes.

4 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: I personally
5 like it. I think it softens the edges.

6 My concern would be exactly that,
7 irrigation, maintenance, making sure that there was
8 continuity, that it is a green space that the entire
9 community could share, and sometimes individual
10 residents shouldn't be left to that, so definitely I
11 would ask more details to that, should this move
12 forward.

13 THE WITNESS: Understood.

14 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: The material on
15 the side facing the Viaduct, concerns about
16 reflections for passing cars either on the upper
17 road or coming down the Viaduct.

18 THE WITNESS: Glass technology is such
19 that these days, it could be non reflective glass
20 very easily, and that's what we would probably put,
21 but we would certainly propose, so that is a very
22 simple answer to --

23 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Have you done a
24 shadow study yet for this building dictating where
25 the sun is coming and how it would reflect against

1 the glass?

2 Even If it's a good glass, it is still
3 going to reflect. You hear all the stories about,
4 you know --

5 THE WITNESS: We have another study,
6 but anecdotally, this facade here that you're
7 speaking of is facing north, so it won't get direct
8 sunlight.

9 During the summertime, the sun will be
10 over, where in the wintertime the sun will be to our
11 south, so there will never be any direct sunlight
12 hitting this facade.

13 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: I think a
14 shadow study and kind of a trajectory of the sun is
15 probably very important, given the fact that the
16 14th Street Viaduct is a main artery coming in and
17 out of town, and I would just -- my concern would be
18 that's not affected by such a large --

19 THE WITNESS: Understood.

20 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: -- hum, you
21 have two lobbies on the floor plans?

22 THE WITNESS: We have two on each
23 street. We got two lobbies on Madison, and two
24 lobbies on Jefferson.

25 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: What is the

1 thinking behind that?

2 THE WITNESS: If you look up at the --
3 let me go to the floor plans.

4 It allows for independent access to --
5 this building -- this property is 200 feet, so one
6 lobby will access easily this half of the building
7 from Madison. One lobby will easily access this
8 half of the building from Jefferson. It is just
9 more elevators, more lobbies, better ease of use for
10 the occupants of the building, not walking 200 feet
11 to their apartment.

12 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: I apologize in
13 advance. This is going to appear to be a blatant
14 question.

15 The idea of the multiple lobbies is not
16 to cut off the affordable units from the building,
17 is it?

18 THE WITNESS: You can't do that. Every
19 lobby is connected to every floor.

20 The only one that's not connected, of
21 course, is these two projected parts of the
22 residential.

23 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Good, perfect.

24 I just wanted to make sure that the
25 integration of those affordable units was at a

1 one-to-one level.

2 THE WITNESS: Yes.

3 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: And then
4 finally, your three traffic scenarios, you have the
5 garage -- the self-park. You have the auto park and
6 you have the valet park.

7 THE WITNESS: Well, they are the same.
8 The valet park and the mechanical are the same.

9 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Okay. So there
10 is only two parking options?

11 THE WITNESS: Yes.

12 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: How are people
13 going to know, and this is a traffic engineer
14 question, and I will definitely ask him, but from an
15 architectural standpoint, what's the thinking in
16 terms of directing the people into the auto park,
17 the valet park versus the self-park?

18 THE WITNESS: Well, if we determine, as
19 I suggested, that the mechanical parking will be
20 mostly for the residents of the building, I guess
21 there might be an overage, but mostly for the
22 residents of the building, they would have a
23 particular entry, which we do have a separate entry
24 for that, that would say "Residents Only," and the
25 other entries could say "Bowling Alley," for

1 example.

2 I think, as you suggested, Mr. Staigar
3 will speak to that in more detail, but I think that
4 is a common sense approach.

5 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Yeah. I think
6 signage is important. I mean, because you could
7 definitely see the probable scenario, which would be
8 people coming to bowl pulling into the residents
9 only thing, having to back up --

10 THE WITNESS: Yes.

11 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: -- causing
12 congestion and a lot of confusion in an area of
13 town, which is up and coming, so I think signage is
14 definitely important on that.

15 THE WITNESS: Okay.

16 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: I know I said
17 final, but this is the last one.

18 Just to follow up on Elliot's question
19 regarding what constitutes a live-work space, I
20 marked down three things that you mentioned, taller
21 doors, a mezzanine --

22 THE WITNESS: Well, if I may, not a
23 mezzanine per se, but a segregation of the sleeping
24 areas, which would allow for a very small non intent
25 business use on the lower section.

1 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: So are there
2 other features that would necessarily constitute
3 these as live-work spaces? Because in my mind right
4 now, they are reading as really nice apartments, and
5 I would love to really understand what a live-work
6 space is as opposed to --

7 THE WITNESS: They can be very nice
8 apartments. That may be what a potential renter
9 would use it for, but we are segregating these and
10 allowing people who want a small office or studio,
11 as I talked about wider doors, bigger doors, so they
12 could get equipment through, the segregation of
13 spaces, and also we are considering ventilation
14 systems.

15 These particular owners are doing just
16 this concept at 1414 Grand Street, a project that we
17 designed. It is under construction now, and they
18 haven't yet put it to market, but there seems to be
19 a lot of interest. People who don't want to
20 commute. People who don't want to travel, who want
21 to have a small office from home and a comfortable
22 way to perhaps see a client.

23 The thinking there is this is a broader
24 idea, not ours per se, that it will be less -- it
25 will allow for less congestion on the streets.

1 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Absolutely.

2 The concept of what work is is
3 changing --

4 THE WITNESS: Yes.

5 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: -- ecommerce is
6 obviously very important to the city.

7 Great.

8 Thank you so much.

9 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

10 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Diane?

11 Richard?

12 COMMISSIONER MURPHY: I guess my only
13 question is also on the live-work, although this
14 would be premature.

15 But my understanding is if you have a
16 home office that you would like to declare as a home
17 office, you need to have a separate bathroom for the
18 IRS, so not that you can't -- the family can't use
19 it, but it is supposed to be a separate --

20 THE WITNESS: That may be the case.

21 We will be providing that anyway,
22 whether that's an IRS requirement or not, just
23 because of the level of differences. There will
24 certainly be a bathroom on the lower floor and
25 obviously there will be a bathroom on the upper

1 floors.

2 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Can you remind me
3 what direction Madison Street goes?

4 THE WITNESS: Madison runs from north
5 to south --

6 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: No. Two ways.

7 THE WITNESS: Oh, it's two-way. I'm
8 sorry.

9 That section is a two-way, correct.
10 That's section is a two-way.

11 Thank you.

12 I only drive it every day.

13 MR. MARSDEN: You're sure you're not an
14 engineer?

15 (Laughter)

16 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Couple of questions.

17 From an architectural standpoint, is
18 there any reason why this could not have been
19 designed with ten-foot setbacks, north, south, east
20 and west?

21 THE WITNESS: Hum, north, south, east
22 and west. Architecturally, no, we could -- this
23 building could be designed with 50-foot setbacks.

24 You know, it is an urban building. Our
25 thought was since lot coverage is already there on

1 the lower floors, we would continue that up.

2 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Is there any reason it
3 couldn't be designed to provide a plaza on each end
4 of the north, south, just facing the side of the
5 building --

6 THE WITNESS: A plaza?

7 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: A little plaza, some
8 open space. There is no open space provided in
9 this.

10 THE WITNESS: It could certainly be
11 designed.

12 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: How close is the north
13 side of the building to the Viaduct?

14 THE WITNESS: I will estimate it for
15 you.

16 Well, our property line -- are you
17 asking for the bowling alley or asking for the
18 residential portions?

19 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: The bowling alley.

20 THE WITNESS: The bowling alley is
21 right at zero lot line, so you know, keep in mind
22 that the Viaduct is in this case 50 or 60 feet above
23 us, probably 15 or 20 feet, maybe 25 feet.

24 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: And that side of the
25 building would be about 40 feet high?

1 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. Let me look,
2 so I can answer it more accurately. The survey
3 might tell me.

4 No, it doesn't. It just gives me the
5 right-of-way of the elevated Viaduct, but based on
6 that it is probably 35 feet, based on the survey.

7 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay.

8 And how much of that is the Viaduct
9 plaza?

10 THE WITNESS: It is under construction
11 now, and I am familiar with the plan. It is a
12 pedestrian walkway directly adjacent to our
13 building. There will be a sidewalk, our sidewalk.
14 There will be a pedestrian walkway, which is about
15 15 or 16 feet wide, that continues all the way
16 towards the east. Then the recreation space beneath
17 the Viaduct, which I think the most recent plan I
18 have seen shows this to be a basketball court in
19 this vicinity.

20 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Speaking about the
21 shadows, you know, I am here to protect John's
22 jurisdiction, so what is the effect of this --

23 THE WITNESS: I thought I was going to
24 get away with it.

25 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Yeah, no, you can't do

1 that.

2 What is the effect of a 13-story
3 building going to be on the light and air and
4 shadows to the property --

5 THE WITNESS: I don't think there's
6 any --

7 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: -- immediately
8 surrounding this?

9 THE WITNESS: -- well, if we're talking
10 about shadows, for example, the shadow that would be
11 cast that is of any consequence, because the sun in
12 the winter comes from the south, which just to
13 remind everybody, it is on this side, so there is no
14 shadow cast in the winter. There's no shadow cast
15 in the direct shadow cast in the spring or fall.

16 During the summer, the sun will come
17 from east to west above us, so there will be a
18 morning shadow cast on the property behind us, which
19 will be Madison Street, and currently it is a
20 one-story industrial building, as well as the cliff
21 behind that.

22 During the afternoon, when the sun is
23 in the west, there will be a shadow cast on what is
24 now adjacent property just between Jefferson and
25 Adams. This is anecdotal just based on my knowledge

1 of how the sun moves in the sky. How big it will
2 be, I don't know.

3 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: But there will be a
4 13-story, 160 -- 158-foot building --

5 THE WITNESS: Certainly there will be a
6 shadow, and my answer to you would be this is an
7 urban environment. Shadows are part of our life.

8 My thought is, and one of the reasons
9 why we think this design would be successful is it
10 would be less intrusive relative to -- although
11 shorter -- Northwest Reevaluation, their building
12 takes up the entire lot.

13 That is our thinking.

14 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: As to the western
15 edge, what is the effect on the western edge?

16 THE WITNESS: Well, on the western edge
17 we got one building that would be affected. That is
18 Block 106 directly to our -- as well as the light
19 rail and the cliff behind us.

20 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay.

21 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Supporting John
22 as well, where are the bikes?

23 THE WITNESS: As I recall this, we have
24 quite a bit of bicycle storage --

25 COMMISSIONER FISHER: I see them. I

1 didn't realize that --

2 THE WITNESS: -- as well as -- and Mr.
3 Chartier will speak to this in more detail, 15
4 electric car charging stations, but he will speak to
5 that in more detail.

6 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay.

7 Board members, any other questions?

8 COMMISSIONER TREMITIEDI: Mr. Chairman,
9 I would like to revisit --

10 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Go ahead.

11 COMMISSIOENR TREMITIEDI: -- regarding
12 the live-work spaces, that intrigues me.

13 The ventilation differences, what would
14 be the difference?

15 THE WITNESS: If an artist wanted to
16 work there and had a particular type of art that
17 produced fumes, that system would take care of it,
18 the ventilation system. Other than -- we have not
19 figured out how many of the apartments, not every
20 one will have that because it would be wasteful, but
21 that is the broader intent.

22 COMMISSIONER TREMITIEDI: Thank you.

23 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Questions?

24 MS. BANYRA: I have a question.

25 Mr. Minervini, then how do you -- you

1 would be regulating, I am going to guess, probably
2 through a homeowners association, the type of uses
3 that govern the live-work potentially?

4 THE WITNESS: Mr. Matule can probably
5 answer that better than I could.

6 MS. BANYRA: Some may not be
7 appropriate in a residential. It might be a great
8 live-work for the person who lives and works, but it
9 may not be appropriate for the person next door.
10 I'm just curious how that becomes -- how do you deal
11 with the uses?

12 MR. MATULE: If it were going to be a
13 condo, it could be dealt with in the substituent
14 documents.

15 If it is rentals, the landlord would
16 have control over that in terms of what uses would
17 be permitted, but I also think the zoning ordinance
18 has some parameters in it in terms of live-work. I
19 think you can only have one outside employee --

20 MS. BANYRA: Okay.

21 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Is this going to be
22 rental property?

23 MR. MATULE: Pardon me?

24 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Is this going to be
25 rental property?

1 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Rental.

2 MR. MATULE: Yes. I am being told it
3 is it going to be a rental property, so that would
4 be something that the landlord certainly would have
5 control over.

6 MS. BANYRA: I wanted to also go back
7 to your --

8 MR. MATULE: If I can just go back, one
9 other thing.

10 MS. BANYRA: Okay.

11 MR. MATULE: I know -- I think it might
12 have been in the other building that had live-work.
13 I know we had a matter here a while ago that was
14 going to have live-work space, and the Board
15 specifically excluded medical type practices,
16 because of the volume of traffic it generated.

17 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: It was Grand Street.

18 MR. MATULE: I think it was.

19 MS. BANYRA: Mr. Minervini, I wanted to
20 go back to your photographs, and maybe you could
21 kind of key the photographs to where that is on your
22 key map.

23 They didn't recognize some of the
24 buildings, and certainly the neighborhood is
25 different than what is represented, so maybe you

1 could just somehow show where --

2 THE WITNESS: Using Sheet Z-1A --

3 MS. BANYRA: -- I think it is the other
4 side, the surrounding pattern.

5 THE WITNESS: -- okay.

6 Using Sheet Z-1A again, the movie
7 theater, so the movie theater is located on the
8 Adams Street and 14th Street section of the Viaduct.
9 This is two blocks away from us.

10 MS. BANYRA: Could you just show it on
11 the top -- maybe the one to the right, 200 feet
12 or --

13 THE WITNESS: Yes, okay, yes -- no.

14 (Laughter)

15 That sort of doesn't cover -- well, I
16 will point to this photograph. The movie theater
17 from here to here.

18 So here is the Viaduct. This comes
19 down.

20 Here's Jefferson Street, between
21 Jefferson and Adams, so it is right here, this
22 section here.

23 This is the one-story commercial
24 property, which I mentioned, which is right here,
25 the parking in front of it towards the north,

1 another view of that building looking from the north
2 to the south.

3 This is a building, a residential
4 building, within the Northwest Redevelopment zone
5 that would be the 13th and Adams intersection at the
6 northeast corner, so that is going to be right
7 here --

8 MS. BANYRA: Okay. So you're --

9 THE WITNESS: -- this is directly to
10 our west --

11 MS. BANYRA: -- Frank, one second.

12 So what you are pointing to is not the
13 key map. You are pointing to the photograph, and
14 you're kind of going off the photograph because it's
15 outside --

16 THE WITNESS: Yes, because there is no
17 other drawing --

18 MS. BANYRA: Okay, okay.

19 THE WITNESS: -- that goes as far as we
20 need for this discussion.

21 MS. BANYRA: Right.

22 THE WITNESS: This is Adams Street
23 looking across Adams.

24 This is further down at 12th and Adams.

25 This is across to our west on Madison

1 Street and 13th, Block 106, as it is known as, so
2 that is --

3 MS. BANYRA: So the residential -- what
4 you are pointing to, though, all of the residential
5 development is more than 200 feet away from the
6 property?

7 THE WITNESS: That's correct.

8 MS. BANYRA: And the closest, I'm going
9 to say new development, the strip retail, the
10 Northwest Redevelopment on the top of 14th and --

11 THE WITNESS: Yes, 14th and Adams --

12 MS. BANYRA: Right, which is --

13 THE WITNESS: -- the whole block in
14 width east and west between 14th -- I mean between
15 Adams and Jefferson.

16 MS. BANYRA: And that is in the
17 Northwest Redevelopment. That's Zone 3 that doesn't
18 permit residential.

19 THE WITNESS: That's correct.

20 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Before you get going,
21 Jeff, let me just ask you to go back to the adaptive
22 reuse.

23 Can you describe the buildings that are
24 going to be saved on both sides of the property?

25 THE WITNESS: Yes.

1 The bowling alley, which is supposed to
2 be, you know, more specifically, the greatest
3 portion of our adaptive reuse. This building had an
4 industrial use. I don't know when it was last used,
5 probably seven or eight years ago, but the common
6 spans are 70 feet or so. So we are reusing this
7 structure basically because of its long column span,
8 which would really be the bowling alley to work very
9 well between it.

10 We are, however, building a new floor
11 section up, so there will be parking at grade level
12 approximately where the slab is now.

13 The floor of the bowling alley will be
14 raised up to base flood elevation, but this
15 structure and the structure itself, not the cladding
16 per se, is going to be reused completely.

17 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Is it a brick
18 structure?

19 THE WITNESS: No. It's a steel
20 skeleton with a metal panel, corrugated metal panel.
21 It is 100 years old. It's really -- although it
22 needs help, it is a beautiful building inside.

23 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: When you say
24 "Beautiful building," it's a steel skeleton?

25 THE WITNESS: Yes.

1 MR. GALVIN: It's got good bones.

2 THE WITNESS: It's got good bones, and
3 the bones are what we need for a bowling alley.
4 It's something very difficult to find certainly in
5 an existing building. It's not only something very
6 difficult to design for in a new building.

7 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: How about the south
8 side of the building?

9 THE WITNESS: The south side here,
10 although you can't see it, there is a portion of a
11 brick facade behind this metal panel.

12 We are proposing to reuse all of this
13 existing space, as well as add -- square it off in
14 essence, add a section here and add a section there.
15 The reason for the section here is specifically
16 because the Gravity Vault or any rock climbing gym
17 needs that volume. Let me go back to the photograph
18 that I showed.

19 They need the height, so we would be
20 providing the height by squaring off that section of
21 the building --

22 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: I get it.

23 THE WITNESS: -- but the bones of that
24 building will be reused as well.

25 The center section, which is now

1 temporary parking, will not be reused.

2 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay.

3 So on the south end, again, it is a
4 skeleton, no brick buildings that are going to be
5 saved?

6 THE WITNESS: There's no brick to be
7 saved, no.

8 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Elliot, go ahead.

9 VICE CHAIR GREENE: You are going to
10 raise the floor of the bowling alley above BFE?

11 THE WITNESS: Yes.

12 VICE CHAIR GREENE: What about the rest
13 of the building?

14 THE WITNESS: There are some commercial
15 spaces that are not. In those cases, and Jeff --
16 Mr. Marsden was probably going to ask me that
17 question, and I should have said it first. It will
18 be wet flood proof, so any section of the
19 building --

20 MR. MARSDEN: Dry flood proof.

21 THE WITNESS: -- I'm sorry?

22 MR. MARSDEN: Dry flood proof.

23 THE WITNESS: -- dry flood proof -- I'm
24 sorry -- would be -- well, there is a difference,
25 and I will explain the difference.

1 But any of the commercial spaces that
2 are within the flood plain will have to be flood
3 proof and require special DEP approval.

4 VICE CHAIR GREENE: What about the
5 parking?

6 THE WITNESS: Parking does not require
7 any special approval -- well, it's --

8 MR. MARSDEN: Needs an individual
9 permit.

10 THE WITNESS: -- you need an individual
11 permit, but you are not required to flood gate that
12 per se.

13 VICE CHAIR GREENE: So you are going to
14 design parking for how many cars on the first floor?

15 THE WITNESS: We have 289 upstairs out
16 of 431 --

17 MR. MATULE: 288.

18 THE WITNESS: -- 288. Thank you

19 So we have 32, 83, and 34, so it would
20 be all of these parking spaces are at grade level --
21 well, now, as I said, we are not required to have --
22 with an individual permit, we are not required to
23 have flood proofing, but we have small penetrations
24 is here. All of these residential -- all of these
25 commercial sections here will the have flood gates,

1 flood barriers.

2 Certainly, if this Board would so
3 direct us to, we could provide them in front of the
4 garage entries as well.

5 VICE CHAIR GREENE: How would the
6 stacking -- if there was a flood -- not if there was
7 a flood -- but when there is a flood, how will the
8 stacking work?

9 THE WITNESS: Stacking is at the second
10 floor above flood --

11 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Will it operate off
12 a generator?

13 THE WITNESS: Well, Mr. Chartier can
14 speak to that. The building is going to have a
15 cogeneration plant, which all of the building's
16 electricity will be run by natural gas.

17 So for Sandy, for example, Hoboken
18 still had natural gas, so the electricity for this
19 building would still be there. The cogeneration
20 plant really works as an emergency generator as
21 well, and he can speak to that in more detail than I
22 can.

23 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Thank you.

24 Sorry to step on your questions, Jeff.

25 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Does it -- does

1 it flood now?

2 THE WITNESS: It certainly --

3 COMMISSIOENR FISHER: This street -- is
4 this one of the areas where it rains a little, and
5 you get three inches --

6 THE WITNESS: Yeah, and thank you for
7 opening up something else for me I should have
8 mentioned.

9 There will be a stormwater detention
10 system here, so right now any rainwater -- it is all
11 impervious. It just goes directly out to the street
12 with the sewer system.

13 With this proposal, all of that water
14 will be kept on site for a certain period of time,
15 and Jeff knows it more than I do, and then slowly
16 release back into the line storm and sanitary sewer
17 system.

18 MR. MATULE: The applicant is also
19 indicating that currently they are operating the
20 garage on all of those levels, and they don't have a
21 flooding issue in the operation of the parking
22 garage now.

23 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Just a quick
24 question.

25 THE WITNESS: Yes.

1 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Garbage
2 disposal, I am assuming it is chutes and a
3 compactor --

4 THE WITNESS: It has yet to be
5 designed, but a building that size will have to have
6 that --

7 MR. GALVIN: What has to be designed?

8 THE WITNESS: A garbage disposal
9 system, so trash chutes and compactors would be part
10 of a -- if the Board so, of course, would approve
11 this building, a final site plan design.

12 MR. GALVIN: Got it. I am working on
13 that.

14 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Was any thought given
15 to developing the property within the permitted
16 uses?

17 THE WITNESS: It is not a question for
18 me.

19 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Board members, anybody
20 else?

21 Jeff, go ahead.

22 MR. MARSDEN: Just a point of
23 correction.

24 According to the Flood Hazard Area Act,
25 you are not allowed to park below the flood plain,

1 okay?

2 DEP has been waiving some of that, but
3 they go by an individual project-to-project base.
4 You may be required to dry flood proof it --

5 THE WITNESS: That's fine --

6 MR. MARSDEN: -- if so, are you able to
7 do that --

8 THE WITNESS: -- we received those
9 approvals on similar orientations of the building.

10 MR. MARSDEN: Infrastructure condition,
11 I looked at that way back when it was Block 112
12 previously, and the infrastructure looks to be in
13 horrible condition. You can't find the base of the
14 inlets.

15 You know, are you going to be
16 reconstructing the infrastructure around your
17 property?

18 THE WITNESS: The infrastructure as it
19 relates to our building, the county is also --

20 MR. MARSDEN: Yeah, they're going to do
21 the 14th Street --

22 THE WITNESS: -- they are going to do
23 the 14th Street section, and they are going to
24 change the street section, so I don't know the
25 answer if we are required then to provide that

1 infrastructure. If we have to, we have to.

2 If we need that, of course, to have a
3 successful building, that's what we'll do --

4 MR. MARSDEN: Well, what I would like
5 to see is having it cleaned and then cameraed to
6 ensure that you're not going to lose it during a bad
7 storm.

8 THE WITNESS: Can we do that?

9 (Witness confers.)

10 THE WITNESS: Of course.

11 MR. MARSDEN: And, if necessary, then
12 repair it or replace it --

13 THE WITNESS: Of course.

14 MR. MARSDEN: Just for, you know, the
15 audience and the Board, you have in accordance with
16 the regulated ABFE that currently holds utility of
17 final approval, you are going to have seven plus
18 feet of water in that area, because the ground
19 elevation I believe is at five, and the flood is at
20 12, so you could have seven or eight feet of water
21 in there.

22 All of your mechanicals, all of your
23 electrical is going to be above that elevation, I
24 presume?

25 THE WITNESS: Yes, and the building

1 department would require that anyway.

2 MR. MARSDEN: All right.

3 Oh, the second floor, when you are
4 going up to park in the mechanical, in the valet
5 section, I don't see that you have a spot where
6 three or four cars might want to, you know, bring
7 their children in, unload some groceries or whatever
8 and have room to park them while they unload that.
9 How do you want to handle that?

10 (Counsel and witness confer)

11 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. Yes.

12 So I am looking at Sheet Z-7, and this
13 ramp would be used for cuing as well as cuing all in
14 here.

15 So with signage, anybody that wants to
16 use this parking will know where to go, where to
17 stop, and the valet will be moving their car.

18 MR. MARSDEN: Yeah. I believe that
19 ramp actually is at 12 percent when I checked the --
20 unless you fixed it --

21 THE WITNESS: Uh-huh.

22 MR. MARSDEN: -- and walking down 12
23 percent slopes with groceries and kids and stuff is
24 not an easy thing to do.

25 THE WITNESS: Fair enough.

1 As I mentioned, we got all of this
2 space to cue on. This is a substantial distance.

3 MR. MARSDEN: But then how do they get
4 out of that space?

5 THE WITNESS: I'm assuming --

6 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Don't they go
7 out the elevator right there and the stairwell?

8 THE WITNESS: -- yes. There is all
9 connections, elevator connections here, and an
10 elevator connection there, and one on either side of
11 the building, as well as the commercial entry.

12 MR. MARSDEN: My concern was this ramp
13 here, that's a little over a 12 percent slope.

14 THE WITNESS: As -- and the traffic
15 engineer can speak to this in more detail, but as I
16 see it, you wouldn't be getting out of your car
17 here. You would be cuing here in the car, and then
18 getting into this point, and the car would be
19 removed.

20 MR. MARSDEN: Okay.

21 Oh, the loading and unloading, the
22 truck unloading and loading. You are talking about
23 a SU-30, straight 30-footer?

24 THE WITNESS: That would work.

25 MR. MARSDEN: Are you sure it is going

1 to make those turns because it will be tight.

2 THE WITNESS: Well, it has a straight
3 back in. This is a straight run in, and this is a
4 pretty wide connection at this point, four feet or
5 so -- I can't see what that is.

6 The reality is the loading zone --

7 MR. MARSDEN: You should look at that.

8 THE WITNESS: -- we can widen this, if
9 we need to, but the reality of a loading zone is it
10 will be used, of course, sometimes by the box
11 trucks, but more often than not, it will be people
12 getting into their cars, but it works for both, and
13 certainly this one works for both because it is a
14 straight run and no turns --

15 COMMISSIONER FISHER: I think you will
16 be surprised -- I think you're going to be surprised
17 that it is more often used for box trucks. We have
18 3500 Fresh Direct deliveries at the Hudson Tea
19 building. That is ten a day.

20 THE WITNESS: Well, Mr. Staigar
21 certainly has a better grip on this than I do.

22 MR. MARSDEN: I guess Joe Staigar can
23 handle it, but I am a little concerned about backing
24 the vehicle up 200 feet just to load and unload,
25 especially, you know, in the condition you might

1 have people trying to park at the same time.

2 THE WITNESS: There's no people
3 parking -- I'm sorry. This is self-park, correct.

4 Well, it is like any parking lot.
5 There has to be common sense used like in any
6 parking lot. This is a parking lot.

7 MR. MARSDEN: I would like to see
8 turning templates on it.

9 THE WITNESS: Understood.

10 MR. MARSDEN: Okay.

11 MS. BANYRA: Hurry up, Jeff. I want to
12 jump in.

13 MR. MARSDEN: Okay.

14 The GPS, you said you used the GPS on
15 the --

16 THE WITNESS: Yes.

17 MR. MARSDEN: -- did you just go by
18 elevation alone?

19 THE WITNESS: I went by the difference
20 in elevation.

21 MR. MARSDEN: You went -- okay, you
22 went by the difference?

23 THE WITNESS: That's right. I was
24 smart enough to do the math.

25 (Laughter)

1 MR. MARSDEN: Go ahead. Jump in.

2 MS. BANYRA: So are the parking spaces
3 assigned to the residential units?

4 THE WITNESS: I don't know. I don't
5 think that's been figured out yet.

6 As I said, when I was describing it, I
7 am thinking, if the Board directs us in another
8 direction, I am thinking that the residential units
9 will be using the mechanical systems, which seems
10 like less transitional.

11 MS. BANYRA: And then I guess my
12 concern was relative to -- I think you did touch on
13 it, but the building and the property behind you,
14 your building is built out to the property lines.

15 THE WITNESS: Yes.

16 MS. BANYRA: So I have two questions.

17 One is the question to the property to
18 the west, because you will have an eight-story
19 building on the property line, you know, so light,
20 air, shadowing, I think that is something different,
21 and that property I think could be impacted by
22 shadows --

23 THE WITNESS: There certainly will be a
24 shadow on that building.

25 MS. BANYRA: -- yeah -- and also, I

1 guess the eight-story wall up on the property line,
2 that is one question.

3 And then the other question I had was
4 just -- it went away. I lost it.

5 THE WITNESS: I will be right there.

6 (Laughter)

7 MR. MARSDEN: Let me just jump in here.

8 You got my letter revised May 15th?

9 THE WITNESS: Yes, I reviewed it.

10 MR. MARSDEN: Are there any specific --
11 I mean, you corrected all of the dates?

12 THE WITNESS: Yes. Most of that I
13 think has been corrected already --

14 MR. MARSDEN: Okay. And you have gone
15 through it. Do you have anything you can't address
16 in there?

17 THE WITNESS: No.

18 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Mr. Greene?

19 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Mr. Minervini, how
20 many -- with 400-some-odd parking spaces, how many
21 handicapped striped spaces are required?

22 THE WITNESS: I think five percent is
23 the number.

24 As I recall, it was -- what is the
25 percentage for parking, do you remember?

1 (Witness confers.)

2 THE WITNESS: Mr. Staigar, our traffic
3 engineer, said five or six --

4 VICE CHAIR GREENE: He said six?

5 THE WITNESS: -- five or six for the
6 self-parking. There is no requirement for obviously
7 the mechanical systems.

8 VICE CHAIR GREENE: I count two.

9 THE WITNESS: Let's see. I know we
10 have more than two.

11 MR. MARSDEN: He is correct.

12 THE WITNESS: That has to be revised,
13 so we certainly will revise it.

14 MR. MARSDEN: That was one of my
15 comments. One and one here.

16 THE WITNESS: You are absolutely right.
17 That will be corrected.

18 MR. MARSDEN: Between 400 and 500
19 parking spaces, you are supposed to have nine
20 handicapped, but because of the way you are setting
21 it up, you --

22 THE WITNESS: Because of the
23 orientation --

24 MR. MARSDEN: -- you're only going to
25 have the --

1 THE WITNESS: -- so we certainly will
2 meet the requirements on any revision required.

3 MS. BANYRA: Frank, did you do a floor
4 area ratio calculation on this?

5 THE WITNESS: I don't think we have.

6 MS. BANYRA: Do you know what that is,
7 though?

8 THE WITNESS: I would have to figure it
9 out for you. I don't know offhand --

10 MS. BANYRA: That would be great.

11 THE WITNESS: -- not right now, because
12 it is more detailed than that.

13 MR. MATULE: Come on. Jimmy McNeight
14 could do it on his watch.

15 (Laughter)

16 THE WITNESS: But it wouldn't be right,
17 but it wouldn't be right, so --

18 (Laughter)

19 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: I did it on my watch.

20 Board members, are we finished?

21 Okay. Seeing no more questions from
22 the Board, let me open it up to the public.

23 Does anybody have questions for the
24 architect?

25 Please come up. State your name and

1 address for the record.

2 MS. HEALEY: Lea Healey, 86 Park.

3 I just have one question.

4 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Can you speak up,
5 please?

6 MS. HEALEY: Sure.

7 The 30 affordable housing units, do you
8 have a bedroom breakdown for that?

9 THE WITNESS: We do not yet.

10 MR. MATULE: Well, let me just address
11 it.

12 The ordinance requires, the specific
13 requirements, not more than twenty percent
14 one-bedroom, at least 30 percent two-bedroom, at
15 least 20 percent three-bedroom, and then the
16 remaining 30 percent can be broken up between twos
17 and threes. They also have to be, half of them, 15
18 would be low income, and 15 would be middle income.

19 MS. HEALEY: And does that ordinance
20 also speak to how the units -- how long the unit
21 remains affordable, and how they are regulated?

22 MR. MATULE: I believe it is 40 years
23 minimum.

24 Part of the problem is our affordable
25 housing ordinance is a work in progress, as we

1 speak. Ms. Bishop is still trying to refine it.
2 She is the consultant for the city, but I believe in
3 the ordinance that was adopted, there was a minimum
4 period of 40 years.

5 MS. HEALEY: Okay.

6 And is there going to be a charge for
7 either one of these types of parking in the
8 building?

9 In other words, will tenants be paying
10 a separate charge to park, and will the commercial
11 space user be charged?

12 THE WITNESS: I don't know the answer
13 to that. The developer could answer that.

14 MR. VILLAMAR: Residential parkers
15 would be paying parking as they would in most
16 residential buildings.

17 The commercial parkers would not be
18 paying -- I'm sorry -- for the retail space, there
19 would be no charge for parking. But for the larger
20 commercial, you know, for the gym, there would be a
21 charge for parking.

22 MS. HEALEY: So how will -- this is
23 probably for the parking person.

24 How will you distinguish between
25 somebody who will not -- go into the space and not

1 have to pay for it versus a paid space?

2 MR. VILLAMAR: It's for actual --

3 MR. GALVIN: No, no.

4 MR. MATULE: Come on up.

5 MR. GALVIN: Yes, we can fix that.

6 MR. MATULE: I don't think the parking
7 guy can answer this question, so Mr. Ahmed, why
8 don't you get sworn in?

9 MR. GALVIN: Raise your right hand,
10 please.

11 Do you swear to tell the truth, the
12 whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you
13 God?

14 MR. AHMED: I do.

15 H A N Y A H M E D, having been duly sworn,
16 testified as follows:

17 MR. GALVIN: State your full name for
18 the record and spell your last name.

19 MR. AHMEN: Hany Ahmed, A-h-m-e d, is
20 the last name --

21 MR. MATULE: Mr. Ahmed, you --

22 MR. GALVIN: Just wait a minute. One
23 second.

24 I raised my voice, so that we will all
25 pick our voice because there are people now leaning

1 forward to listen to what we have to say. Just try
2 a little harder to project, everybody, okay?

3 Thank you.

4 MR. MATULE: Mr. Ahmed, you are a
5 principal of the applicant?

6 THE WITNESS: Correct.

7 MR. MATULE: And have you heard
8 Ms. Healey's question about parking?

9 THE WITNESS: Yes, I have.

10 MR. MATULE: Could you give an answer?

11 THE WITNESS: The parking for the
12 actual workers and the employees of the retail
13 portion will have a lot of spaces in the building.

14 For the patrons, the customers from the
15 bowling alley to the rock gym and to the residents,
16 that would be a paid for portion based on that.

17 What we intend on doing with the
18 bowling alley and the rock gym is what we have done
19 with other establishments before is that you set
20 aside a certain amount of spaces for them. They
21 actually ask for that.

22 Let's say, the bowling alley, for
23 example, may want 50 or 60 spaces guaranteed at all
24 times, and they will have a ticket book that we will
25 work with them on.

1 We are going to have an operator, a
2 professional parking operator, come in and address
3 the parking for us and cut these deals, and they
4 will be in the leases themselves. The operators are
5 going to want them, and we are going to want them,
6 and it protects them, and it protects us.

7 With respect to something that was said
8 earlier that I want to correct, the parking on the
9 lower level, that is self-park. So if you want to
10 come in and get a cup of coffee, you can park
11 yourself, get a cup of coffee, pay for it and go
12 out.

13 On the second floor, that is a 24-hour
14 valet parking system. The reason why we segregated
15 the two is that in the event of a flood, we can take
16 all of the cars downstairs, whether they are patrons
17 or residents that feel like parking down there for a
18 privileged spot or something, and we could put these
19 parking spots in the stackers.

20 Now, that will fill the system up to
21 its maximum capacity.

22 What does that mean?

23 It takes you 45 minutes to unline it.
24 But the good thing with a flood is that it's a
25 predictable event. It doesn't happen overnight.

1 It's not an earthquake. It's not a tornado. It's
2 something that we can predict and plan for and also
3 deal with the next day.

4 MS. HEALEY: You didn't mention any
5 interior amenities of the building.

6 Are there any things like a gym and --
7 F R A N K M I N E R V I N I, having been
8 previously sworn, testified further as follows:

9 THE WITNESS: I did briefly as I went
10 through the third floor plan --

11 MS. HEALEY: I'm sorry. I must have
12 missed it.

13 THE WITNESS: -- yeah, I did it
14 quickly, so you may have missed it.

15 The third floor, other than the outdoor
16 space, which I have mentioned, we are proposing a
17 thousand square foot gym, an 800 square foot common
18 space, and these are all on the third floor at the
19 lowest level of residential, as well as another
20 thousand square feet of common space, so the third
21 floor has the majority of our resident only spaces.

22 MS. HEALEY: And are those amenities
23 open to both affordable and non affordable units?

24 MR. MINERVINI: Of course.

25 MS. HEALEY: Thank you.

1 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Any other questions
2 from the public?

3 Please come forward.

4 MR. GALVIN: I think he said it is
5 getting chilly in here.

6 You don't have to get sworn in. Just
7 state your full name for the record and spell your
8 last name.

9 MR. EVERS: Michael Evers, E-v-e-r-s.

10 MR. GALVIN: And your street address
11 again? I'm sorry.

12 MR. EVERS: 252 Second Street, Hoboken.

13 MR. GALVIN: Thank you.

14 MR. EVERS: Mr. Minervini, with regard
15 to your incredibly cool project, I don't want to say
16 anything prejudicial.

17 However, you are aware that the plan of
18 compliance for the affordable housing units has got
19 some serious errors that you no doubt are going to
20 update on the next round to reflect Bob Matule's
21 clear understanding of the distribution of units in
22 the building?

23 THE WITNESS: Yes.

24 MR. EVERS: Excellent.

25 You are also aware that the Council on

1 Affordable Housing has a wonderful WebCheck's --

2 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

3 MR. EVERS: -- spreadsheet available on
4 its website that answers many of the questions that
5 still seem to confuse some of the professionals
6 regarding this project.

7 And last, but not least, you are aware
8 possibly - I am because I spoke to her yesterday -
9 that Mrs. Bishop doesn't know what anybody is
10 talking about with regard to her input into this
11 process.

12 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Is there a question,
13 Mr. Evers?

14 MR. EVERS: Yes. I asked him if he was
15 aware of that.

16 THE WITNESS: Yes, I am now.

17 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Thank you.

18 MR. EVERS: Thank you.

19 I have no further questions.

20 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Anybody else have
21 questions for the architect?

22 MR. SILVERMAN: Right here.

23 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Sir?

24 MR. SILVERMAN: Steve Silverman, part
25 owner of the property across the street.

1 MR. GALVIN: Could you spell your last
2 name?

3 MR. SILVERMAN: Silverman,
4 S-i-l-v-e-r-m-a-n.

5 MR. GALVIN: Okay. We are not
6 testifying at this point. We're just asking
7 questions.

8 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: What property is that
9 across --

10 MR. SILVERMAN: 1300 to 1400 Madison.

11 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Thank you.

12 MR. SILVERMAN: I'm just stating for
13 the record that we don't have any problems with the
14 shadow of the building, and if there is any --

15 MR. GALVIN: That is testimony
16 actually.

17 MR. SILVERMAN: -- okay.

18 Just if there is a need for parking, we
19 can provide it temporarily.

20 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

21 VICE CHAIR GREENE: I see another hand.

22 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Please come forward.

23 MR. GALVIN: State your full name for
24 the record and spell your last name.

25 MS. GRAHAM: My name is Ann Graham,

1 G-r-a-h-a-m.

2 I live at 1021 Grand Street, Hoboken.

3 It is hard for me to see back there. I
4 have appreciation for people that sit in the back --

5 MR. GALVIN: Could you stop for one
6 second?

7 Can you just come to the edge here, and
8 let me talk to you over here.

9 (Counsel confers with Ms. Graham.)

10 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Anybody else?

11 Anybody else wish to ask Mr. Minervini
12 a question?

13 Seeing none, can I have a motion to
14 close?

15 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Motion to close
16 the public portion.

17 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Second.

18 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

19 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: All in favor?

20 (All Board members voted in the
21 affirmative.)

22 MR. GALVIN: I just wanted to stated
23 for the record that Mrs. Graham got up. Mrs. Graham
24 did not participate in this hearing.

25 MR. MATULE: So noted.

1 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Great.

2 MR. MATULE: Shall we proceed?

3 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Do you want a break?

4 (Board members confer.)

5 MR. GALVIN: Who is your next witness?

6 MR. MATULE: Mr. Chartier.

7 (Board members confer.)

8 MR. GALVIN: He won't be that long.

9 MR. MATULE: I don't think he will be

10 that long, maybe ten minutes.

11 MR. GALVIN: Now you have to turn off

12 the air-conditioner for a little while.

13 (Board members confer.)

14 MS. CARCONE: Now you're too cold?

15 MR. GALVIN: Yes. I heard snoring

16 noises.

17 (Laughter)

18 MR. MATULE: That is how we are keeping

19 everybody awake.

20 MR. GALVIN: We are going to keep going

21 back and forth. This is like menopause for the rest

22 of us.

23 (Laughter)

24 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay.

25 MR. MATULE: Mr. Chartier.

1 MR. GALVIN: Raise your right hand.
2 Do you swear to tell the truth, the
3 whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you
4 God?

5 MR. CHARTIER: I do.

6 T O M C H A R T I E R, having been duly sworn,
7 testified as follows:

8 MR. GALVIN: State your full name for
9 the record and spell your last name.

10 THE WITNESS: Tom Chartier,
11 C-h-a-r-t-i-e-r.

12 MR. GALVIN: Mr. Chairman, do you
13 accept Mr. Chartier's credentials as a -- what would
14 you say, as a LEED certification specialist?

15 THE WITNESS: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Sound s good.

17 Yes, we do.

18 MR. MATULE: Mr. Chartier, you are
19 working with the applicant with respect to the green
20 aspects of the proposed building, correct?

21 THE WITNESS: Yes.

22 MR. MATULE: Is the applicant proposing
23 to apply for a LEED certification for the building?

24 THE WITNESS: Yes, they are.

25 MR. MATULE: And do you know at this

1 point what level of certification they would be
2 seeking?

3 THE WITNESS: LEED gold certification.

4 MR. MATULE: Can you tell us what
5 specific green features would be incorporated into
6 the building to help you achieve that level?

7 THE WITNESS: Yes, I can.

8 MR. MATULE: I see you have brought a
9 handout here.

10 Is this your synopsis of the
11 sustainability design?

12 THE WITNESS: Yes. This is just bullet
13 points that explain how we are going to get to the
14 LEED gold certification. There is a checklist on
15 the back that gives the points that we are
16 anticipating.

17 MR. MATULE: I am going to mark this
18 A-9 for the record, and if you want to pass those
19 around. I'm sure there's more than enough.

20 (Exhibit A-9 marked.)

21 MR. GALVIN: Mr. Chartier, so far I
22 marked down the building will have bicycle storage
23 as shown on the plan.

24 The building is to have 13 car charging
25 stations --

1 THE WITNESS: Fourteen.

2 MR. GALVIN: -- fourteen.

3 And the building is to have a
4 cogeneration plant, which will double as an
5 emergency backup system, if that helps.

6 THE WITNESS: Correct.

7 MR. MATULE: Two things. As far as the
8 bicycle storage, do you know how many spaces there
9 will be?

10 THE WITNESS: There will be a minimum
11 of 110.

12 MR. MATULE: That will be in several
13 locations within the building?

14 THE WITNESS: Yes.

15 MR. MATULE: As far as the
16 cogeneration, could you just expand upon that a
17 little bit?

18 THE WITNESS: Cogen is sort of -- it is
19 also known as a combined heat and power system. It
20 burns natural gas, and it generates electricity.
21 You capture the waste heat from the combustion, and
22 you use it typically for domestic hot water.

23 This is also going to act as an
24 emergency backup generator system, so the idea is to
25 provide life safety. It will most likely feed the

1 fire protection system, the elevators, the lighting.
2 We are hoping it will provide for possible cell
3 phone charging stations, refrigeration, security to
4 the building, a lot of problems that plagued most
5 buildings during Hurricane Sandy, this will address
6 that.

7 MR. MATULE: And you are also planning
8 on having on-site detention and retention?

9 THE WITNESS: Yes.

10 The building will have -- will meet at
11 a minimum the North Hudson Sewerage Authority
12 requirements for stormwater detention and will also
13 have additional retention that will be used for
14 flushing toilets and probably irrigation.

15 MR. MATULE: Are you going to have
16 any -- I know the facade of the building shows some
17 greenery, but are you going to have any other green
18 roofs or other vegetation on the site?

19 THE WITNESS: A minimum of 10,000
20 square feet of vegetated green roof.

21 MR. MATULE: Will that also assist in
22 capturing stormwater?

23 THE WITNESS: It will absorb
24 approximately a thousand gallons of stormwater, and
25 it also will help to restore the vegetation, the eco

1 habitat that existed long ago before the building
2 was developed into the warehouse that it is the now.

3 It will also help off set what we call
4 the urban heat island effect, which basically
5 results in a 15 to 30-degree temperature increase in
6 urban areas of Hoboken that are covered in concrete
7 and asphalt.

8 This will help bring that local
9 temperature down as a benefit not only on this
10 block, but the entire neighborhood.

11 MR. MATULE: What other types of things
12 would you be doing to achieve LEED certification in
13 terms of materials or --

14 THE WITNESS: The project is going to
15 divert a minimum of 75 percent of all of the
16 construction waste from the landfill and it will
17 also be recycled.

18 We are designing the building with low
19 embodied energy materials, which is aluminum and
20 products made from recyclable contents and products
21 made locally.

22 The indoor environmental quality, the
23 air quality of the building is going to be better.
24 It will be built with low toxicity or non toxic,
25 what we call low view sea products that just

1 improves the overall air quality in the building and
2 avoids what used to occur in these buildings called
3 the sick building syndrome.

4 We are also providing increased
5 ventilation to the residential areas and the
6 commercial areas, which does provide a health
7 benefit to all of the residents, the workers, and
8 the visitors to the project.

9 We are proposing to plant street trees
10 all around the property, and subject to city
11 approval, working with the Department of Public
12 Parking and Transportation, we are proposing to
13 install rain gardens around the property and
14 possibly install an electric vehicle charging
15 station for a proposed Hertz corner car. It's a
16 certain name on it.

17 MR. MATULE: Anything else that you
18 would like to add?

19 THE WITNESS: I think it is important
20 just to note something about this particular
21 developer. This is a developer that has experience
22 with environmentally friendly design and
23 construction in the past. One of the first projects
24 was what we called the Beer Garden, which was an
25 adaptive reuse and a rehabilitation of an existing

1 structure. Most developers would have knocked that
2 down. They did not.

3 They are also currently seeking LEED
4 gold certification on 1414 Grand, which is currently
5 under construction, where they decided on their own,
6 because they believe that to install geothermal
7 heating and cooling system, LED lighting throughout
8 the building, rooftop photovoltaic or solar panels,
9 all of these things come with big price tags. They
10 did not have to do it for a special requirement, but
11 they decided to do that on their own.

12 I consider them to be trailblazers in
13 this field. They are one of a very small handful of
14 builders that are actually trying to solve Hoboken's
15 problems of flooding and aging and overburden of the
16 power, water and sewer infrastructure by building
17 this type of construction, and I think that sums it
18 up.

19 MR. MATULE: Thank you.

20 MR. GALVIN: Did you say there were
21 going to be solar panels?

22 THE WITNESS: Not on this project.

23 MR. GALVIN: Okay. I'm sorry. I
24 thought I heard that.

25 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Board members?

1 VICE CHAIR GREENE: The cogen, that is
2 designed to provide an emergency backup for all of
3 the life safety systems and the elevators. What
4 about the parking garage?

5 THE WITNESS: And the parking garage.

6 VICE CHAIR GREENE: There is enough?

7 It generates enough kilowatts to
8 operate, to be able to get 200 and some odd vehicles
9 out, if you have to?

10 THE WITNESS: Yes. It has to be
11 designed. We have in the past designed 60-kilowatt
12 cogen plants.

13 This one may grow. The building
14 department is slowly catching on to the idea of
15 using gas as an emergency backup power source, so
16 the building department is sort of evolving, and you
17 know, we are sort of pushing them to the limit.

18 Right now we are proposing a minimum of
19 60 kw, which I believe is more than adequate to
20 serve the garage, fire protection and lighting, and
21 then also have certain receptacles. We are looking
22 to grow it based on the available heat source, so
23 you kind of have to balance cogen between what you
24 use the heat for, and you know, what your sort of
25 electric load is.

1 VICE CHAIR GREENE: And where will this
2 be located?

3 THE WITNESS: It will be above the
4 flood elevation, of course. I don't believe it is
5 shown on the plans yet.

6 I mean, typically they go on the roof
7 or go in the machine room.

8 VICE CHAIR GREENE: If it goes in the
9 machine room, how would it be exhausted?

10 THE WITNESS: It is ducted.

11 I mean, the ideal place is on the roof,
12 but the system that we are currently looking at for
13 this project has a soundproof enclosure. It is not
14 entirely soundproof, but from three feet away it is
15 only 51 decibels, so it will be relatively quiet and
16 it's weatherproof.

17 VICE CHAIR GREENE: How tall is it?

18 THE WITNESS: It's about probably six
19 feet total with the flue.

20 VICE CHAIR GREENE: It is not on the
21 plans, so would that six feet be added to the
22 building height?

23 THE WITNESS: I imagine it's not going
24 to be taller than any of the stairwell pits. It
25 won't be the tallest thing on the roof.

1 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Thank you.

2 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Any other Board
3 members?

4 MR. GALVIN: Can we get a verification
5 on where the cogen unit is going to be located?

6 MR. MATULE: Where is the cogen?

7 MR. GALVIN: Yes.

8 MR. MATULE: I can ask the architect.
9 I don't know if --

10 MR. GALVIN: Right. We thought we
11 heard the second floor, but I'm not positive.

12 MR. MINERVINI: Mr. Chartier is right,
13 and I guess I am testifying to this. We are putting
14 it on the lower roof sections. We have lower roofs
15 that we can cordon off the space for it.

16 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Which lower roofs?

17 MR. MINERVINI: We have a lower roof
18 above the parking garage, a lower roof above the
19 commercial space on Jefferson and 13th, as well as
20 above the rock climbing gym.

21 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Wouldn't that
22 impact residences, though?

23 MR. MINERVINI: There is ample space
24 that it could be segregated and screened, and they
25 are not very loud, as he testified to.

1 Now, we can also put it on the upper
2 roof. I mentioned the lower roof because you seem
3 to be, you know, you might have an issue per se with
4 the upper roof. But at six feet in height, it is
5 still less than the stair bulkhead and still less
6 than the elevator bulkhead, and I think generally
7 speaking for efficiency, it is better on the upper
8 roof.

9 MR. CHARTIER: It's better on the upper
10 roof.

11 MR. MINERVINI: So if I may, one of the
12 roofs, and our next plan, if, of course approved, we
13 can show that.

14 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: And while you are
15 there, Mr. Minervini --

16 MR. MINERVINI: Yes.

17 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: -- are the elevator or
18 the stair bulkheads on the roof higher -- does that
19 add height to the building?

20 Is it 158 plus the height of --

21 MR. MINERVINI: Always. Every single
22 building, and so the public is clear, that is not
23 included in your height.

24 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: It is not included?

25 MR. MINERVINI: It's not included.

1 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: And about how tall
2 would the elevator bulkheads be?

3 MR. MINERVINI: The elevator bulkhead
4 in this case, probably about seven or eight feet,
5 perhaps more, depending on the type of elevator we
6 use, whether it's a traction elevator or not. The
7 stair bulkhead would be eight or nine feet.

8 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Good.

9 Thanks.

10 Anything else for Mr. Chartier?

11 MS. BANYRA: I have a question.

12 Mr. Chartier, did you -- is there
13 anything that you can do with gray water on this
14 property?

15 THE WITNESS: Yes. I call it the
16 stormwater retention system. It is a gray water
17 system, so we are going to flush toilets with it and
18 use it for irrigation.

19 MS. BANYRA: It's rainwater capture,
20 though, as opposed to sink?

21 THE WITNESS: It's rainwater capture.

22 Believe me, I would love to capture
23 waste water from laundry for sinks. Right now I
24 don't believe the building department would let us.

25 We have run into this, you know, in

1 other areas of Manhattan, especially where they, you
2 know, the approving agency is usually what sort of
3 holds us back.

4 MS. BANYRA: Okay.

5 Thank you.

6 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Mr. Matule, I'm not
7 sure Mr. Chartier is the right person to address
8 this, but I believe I read in the papers that there
9 is contamination under the slab?

10 MR. MATULE: I can bring up one of the
11 applicants, and they have both been sworn, so --

12 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Sure.

13 MR. MATULE: -- Mr. Villamar, can you
14 address that?

15 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Well, let me ask the
16 question, and it will put it in context.

17 One of the community benefits is the
18 installation of the street trees, and again, if the
19 slab is being used as a protective cap in accordance
20 with a deed notice or something like that, you know,
21 is it going to be a problem delivering the street
22 trees?

23 MR. MATULE: Before he answers, I can
24 answer that question because the street trees are
25 not on our property. The sidewalks and anything off

1 of our property would not be -- even if there were
2 contamination there, it would not be the property
3 owners. I'm not dismissing it, but it would be
4 something that we would have to work with the city
5 with in terms of remediation.

6 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Are you aware of any
7 deed notices?

8 MR. VILLAMAR: We have no deed notice
9 on the property now. We have had an extensive
10 environmental investigation including in Phase I and
11 Phase II on the property. There are no issues other
12 than historic fill. There's no necessity for a cap
13 at this point that would involve any trees or
14 anything that is on our property itself.

15 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay.

16 COMMISSIONER FISHER: There is no
17 necessity for a cap?

18 I thought the paper said there was a
19 necessity for a cap.

20 MR. VILLAMAR: Not for the sidewalk --

21 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Not for the
22 sidewalk, but for the rest --

23 MR. VILLAMAR: -- the entire building
24 will have by virtue of the fact that it's a parking
25 lot, will have a foundation completely poured

1 surface --

2 COMMISSIONER FISHER: But it's -- just
3 for clarity --

4 MR. VILLAMAR: There's no D variance.

5 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- there's no
6 necessity to do that?

7 I thought how it was described in the
8 application is that part of the reason and the need
9 for a hundred percent lot coverage, not just the
10 desire, that you had to have that cap for
11 environmental purposes.

12 Wasn't that in your application?

13 MR. VILLAMAR: There is historic fill,
14 which is typical for all industrial areas.

15 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Maybe I misread
16 it --

17 MR. MATULE: I don't think so --

18 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: You are right.

19 MR. MATULE: -- maybe that was in the
20 resolution from the prior --

21 COMMISSIONER FISHER: It's something I
22 read. I may not have gotten all of the terms right,
23 but I thought it was required -- a hundred percent
24 lot coverage was required.

25 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: It may have been in

1 Mr. Kolling's report. I'm not sure I read it as
2 well --

3 MR. VILLAMAR: Well, we will have a
4 hundred percent coverage on the first floor lot, but
5 it won't involve any sidewalk, tree pits --

6 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Anybody else have
7 questions for Mr. Chartier?

8 Let me open it up to the -- I'm sorry,
9 Jeff, go ahead.

10 MR. MARSDEN: I have one question.

11 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Go ahead.

12 MR. MARSDEN: When you mentioned the --
13 there were no USTs on this site that were removed
14 and closed?

15 MR. VILLAMAR: I'm not aware that there
16 were ever any USTs on the site, but--

17 MS. BANYRA: Share what that means for
18 the public.

19 MR. MARSDEN: Oh, Underground Storage
20 Tanks.

21 MR. MATULE: Could Phase I indicate
22 that?

23 MR. VILLAMAR: I mean, I only call it a
24 total Phase I and Phase II, but there are no
25 existing environmental remediation programs or any

1 other work that we have to do for the DEP.

2 If there had been any underground
3 storage tanks leaking or otherwise, they would have
4 been resolved by now before we owned the property.

5 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: I will open it up to
6 the public.

7 Anybody have questions for Mr.
8 Chartier?

9 Please, Ms. Healey.

10 MS. HEALEY: Ms. Healey again.

11 I just want to clarify.

12 The system that you are putting in will
13 be for emergency backup for sure, but the other
14 possible generation of electricity is not certain.
15 You said maybe?

16 THE WITNESS: No, it will grow.

17 It will most likely consist of maybe three or four
18 different actual pieces of equipment. It could be
19 one combined piece of equipment.

20 The benefit of having say four of them
21 is that two of them have --

22 MR. GALVIN: God bless you.

23 THE WITNESS: -- during the day when
24 there is less occupancy when people are at work,
25 people are not taking showers or whatever, they

1 aren't using power, and it can ramp up to three or
2 four when there is a much bigger demand for power
3 for the heat. Then you can also maintain them, so
4 that they are always running.

5 The benefit on top of the efficiency
6 that comes with this is the fact that with a typical
7 emergency generator, you turn it on once a month.
8 Then when there is an actual emergency, you hope it
9 works.

10 With these, they are being maintained
11 year round, and you know that they are working.
12 When there is an actual power outage, it is
13 seamless. The people in the building wouldn't even
14 know that they lost power.

15 MS. HEALEY: So it could be generating
16 electricity during times other than power outages?

17 THE WITNESS: Yes. It will generate
18 power year round.

19 MS. HEALEY: Okay. Now, you just said
20 there may be more than one of these things. Is that
21 more than one of these six foot things?

22 THE WITNESS: Yes --

23 MS. HEALEY: So --

24 THE WITNESS: -- typically the
25 footprint doesn't change, whether it's one unit or

1 four units.

2 MS. HEALEY: -- at what point in the
3 process do we get the drawing of --

4 THE WITNESS: After we get an approval
5 tonight, we move on to final site plan approval, and
6 we start actually going into the full design when we
7 start doing the full load calculations and coming up
8 with what the actual electrical demand is and what
9 the power or heat load is.

10 MS. HEALEY: So we are not going to
11 know the full system until after Board approval?

12 We are not going to see the full system
13 or a drawing of it?

14 THE WITNESS: I mean, yeah, it is just
15 like with anything. I mean, this is a zoning
16 application, so these are not construction
17 documents. This is not a full design. This is the
18 intent. I mean, you know, the resolution can limit
19 us to one unit --

20 MR. MATULE: If I could just respond
21 also.

22 Typically because this is only
23 preliminary site plan approval, assuming some form
24 of an approval is given, either what we are asking
25 for or some iteration of it, that is when the

1 architects and the environmental people go back and
2 actually design the building and do the construction
3 design and figure out all of these little details,
4 and that is what we present back to the Board when
5 we come back for final site plan approval.

6 MS. HEALEY: Okay.

7 MR. MATULE: And if, as often happens
8 between now and then, if when they do the
9 construction drawings and the final designs, if
10 there is any substantive changes, then what we
11 typically do is we come back for amended preliminary
12 and final site plan approval, if there is a change
13 that is deemed substantive enough to require a
14 formal application for an amendment for the Board.

15 I think that is the whole way that the
16 system was designed, so you don't have to go spend
17 all of the big money upfront designing your
18 building.

19 MR. GALVIN: You know, it depends.

20 I mean, if there is an element that we need to see
21 in order to approve the site plan, we need to see
22 it. I mean, I don't know that -- the LEED
23 certification, so often with LEED certification,
24 they don't even get LEED certification until after
25 the building permit has been issued and the building

1 has been constructed, and then they get LEED
2 certification, so I have kind of given up on some
3 aspect of this.

4 What I am asking Mr. Chartier, and he
5 knows that I am going to do this in every case is I
6 want to know what he is going to specifically
7 install in this building and make a commitment to,
8 and I generated a list of those things that are
9 going to happen whether they get LEED certification
10 or not.

11 MS. HEALEY: I guess because I just
12 wonder if it makes a difference to the public
13 whether or not what roof you are putting this on,
14 but you mentioned green roofs.

15 Where are these green roofs going to
16 be? On all of the roofs, on some of them?

17 THE WITNESS: The vegetation is
18 actually sort of split up between the different
19 roofs.

20 MR. GALVIN: Mr. Minervini is probably
21 better to help with that --

22 MS. HEALEY: I'm sorry. I thought he
23 testified to green roofs --

24 MR. GALVIN: No, no, no. That's all
25 right, because he knows what is on the drawing.

1 MR. MINERVINI: I will differentiate
2 between a green roof and a landscaped roof.

3 The lower section that will be occupied
4 outdoor space for use by the residents, which is the
5 roof of the parking garage is a landscaped roof.

6 Our outdoor terrace is a landscaped
7 roof.

8 We have one particular roof, which is
9 an extensive green roof. It is not walkable, and
10 Tom can speak to how much water it will actually
11 hold.

12 Do you have the drawing, Bob?

13 MR. MATULE: Z-13 I guess or Z --

14 MR. MINERVINI: Yes.

15 So if you look at Z-13, this is our
16 main roof drawing. These are all private roof decks
17 at the roof of the two portions of the residential
18 building that are 13 stories.

19 The roofs below have -- this roof is
20 meant for use of the third floor.

21 This roof is the extensive green roof,
22 so it is at the seventh floor section, which is the
23 roof of the rock climbing gym.

24 The roof of the rock climbing will have
25 an extensive green roof, and Tom can speak to what

1 its positives are.

2 The roof of the commercial space
3 adjacent to it at the third floor will be an outdoor
4 use for the residents, and as I just mentioned, the
5 roof of the garage in between the two buildings is a
6 landscaped roof for use of the residents.

7 MS. HEALEY: So the only green roof --
8 certified green roof, I assume it is, is above the
9 bowling alley?

10 THE WITNESS: So there is really three
11 different types of green roofs. I mean, one is a
12 white reflective roof, which basically is - a
13 typical black sort of asphalt type of roof absorbs a
14 hundred percent of the sun's radiation and then it
15 heats the building. A white reflective roof bounces
16 it back. A hundred percent of the residential roof,
17 the new construction roof, is going to have a white
18 reflective roof.

19 Then on top of that, it will have
20 10,000 square feet of what we call vegetating roof,
21 which is a separate type of green roof.

22 MS. HEALEY: Which you are calling a
23 landscaped roof?

24 MR. CHARTIER: It is vegetated.

25 MR. MINERVINI: Two different roofs.

1 MS. HEALEY: Yeah. I am looking for
2 the distinction between simply a landscaped roof and
3 a true green roof with vegetation that's designed
4 to --

5 MR. MINERVINI: I will do it again,
6 because I wasn't so clear.

7 MS. HEALEY: Yeah, okay.

8 MR. MINERVINI: The roof -- I will use
9 the smaller drawing, if you want. This is larger.

10 But the roof of the rock climbing gym
11 is an extensive green roof. That's just the roof
12 that you are describing. That cannot be used for
13 anything. There's no use for the occupants. It is
14 meant just to -- and Tom will speak to this in more
15 detail -- it's just meant to absorb soil radiation
16 and retain water.

17 MS. HEALEY: What's the dimensions of
18 that?

19 MR. MINERVINI: It is 4,266 square
20 feet. We got that roof section, the other roof
21 section, which is above the commercial space
22 adjacent to it is meant to be landscaped and meant
23 for use of the building's occupants.

24 The main roof at the thirteenth floor
25 is to be used by the building's occupants. So where

1 we are not using the roof for mechanicals or
2 building's occupants, it will be an extensive green
3 roof, and that's 4,266 square feet above the rock
4 climbing gym.

5 MS. HEALEY: Thank you.

6 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Anybody else have
7 questions for Mr. Chartier?

8 Are you finished, Mr. Matule?

9 MR. MATULE: I have no further
10 questions.

11 MR. WHITE: Yeah. My name is David
12 White. I live on Garden Street.

13 Could you please explain what you are
14 talking about in terms of stormwater retention and
15 reuse?

16 MR. CHARTIER: Sure.

17 So there are two systems really.
18 There's the stormwater detention system, which is
19 our gray water system, where we are actually going
20 to collect rainwater that comes down from the roof.
21 It is going to drain into this tank, above ground
22 tank, and it's going to fill up.

23 We are going to hold that water and use
24 it to flush toilets, so we are going to off set a
25 hundred percent of the water that is normally

1 provided from United Water. We are going to offset
2 that with collected rainwater.

3 As that overflows, it is going to
4 overflow into our stormwater retention system, which
5 is below the foundation, and that just slows the
6 flow of water during a storm.

7 So right now this building is a hundred
8 percent impervious. Every drop of rainwater that
9 falls on it runs off into the street and eventually
10 makes it go out to the sewer possibly or it just
11 floods the street, which happens really in this
12 area.

13 A typical one-inch rainstorm delivers
14 50,000 gallons of water on this site, so we are
15 going to hold that back. That is just a very
16 typical rainstorm.

17 So we will keep 50,000 gallons of
18 rainwater out of the sewer system during the storm,
19 and then it will eventually make its way back into
20 the sewer system, but once the sewers are dry and
21 empty to prevent flooding.

22 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Where is this above
23 ground tank located?

24 MR. CHARTIER: I mean, it's still to be
25 decided, but it has to be out of the flood

1 elevation.

2 VICE CHAIR GREENE: So it will --

3 MR. CHARTIER: It will be in the
4 garage.

5 VICE CHAIR GREENE: -- in the garage?

6 THE WITNESS: It will be in the garage.

7 MS. BANYRA: Tom, how big would that
8 tank be?

9 THE WITNESS: It still has to sort of
10 be calculated backwards from --

11 MS. BANYRA: Guesstimate.

12 THE WITNESS: -- it's probably going to
13 be somewhere around 30,000 gallons.

14 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Is that provided for
15 in the plans?

16 THE WITNESS: I don't know if we
17 clearly show it. We show the detention system in
18 the plans. The actual above ground tank is still --

19 MS. BANYRA: Okay.

20 MR. MATULE: If you can answer the
21 question.

22 MR. AHMED: Yeah.

23 With regard to the north side of the
24 building, it is a 21,000 square foot roof that you
25 are talking about. We would like to make it a green

1 roof, but we can't commit to that yet for one very
2 specific -- or two reasons.

3 On the inside of that building we have
4 a hundred-year-old roof that is all old plans, and
5 part of the tenants that we were talking to, that
6 was part of the charm of the building in keeping the
7 old building.

8 It is a steel skeleton structure about,
9 hum, 88 to 91 feet spans. It is 105 by 200. There
10 are no columns in the center.

11 We may have to build a roof over that,
12 but we have to calculate the load of that roof,
13 which means I have to rip out a pile, and I have to
14 see what that pile can take in stress. So we are
15 keeping the old structure. An engineer has to work
16 backwards, and say this roof can hold X.

17 In that, if he says, it could hold a
18 green roof, we will put a green roof in.

19 If he says the weight can't hold a
20 green roof, we are going to put a reflective roof in
21 and capture the water and reuse that water. But
22 until an engineer can tell us that, which we have to
23 penetrate a pile that's over a hundred years old, we
24 can't make that determination. It's not like we are
25 ducking out of it.

1 As Tom said earlier, a building we did
2 a few block away, we promised zero green aspects of
3 it. There was nothing on the record when we came
4 from the approval.

5 We went from that to going to gold and
6 platinum. We never mentioned that. We dug down 300
7 foot wells under a hundred foot slab -- I'm sorry --
8 a hundred percent coverage slab. It has never been
9 done before. They looked at us like we were crazy.
10 We did this to put geothermal in.

11 The cost skyrocketed. The cost of a
12 normal heating and cooling system in that building,
13 it went up 600 percent to put that technology in,
14 and we did it. We didn't mention it to the Board,
15 but we did it, so there are other technologies that
16 we have been speaking to Tom about, but it is hard
17 to say, because as technology evolves literally six
18 months from now, something else will be out, and
19 another six months from now, something else will be
20 out. But we are not ducking it in any way. If we
21 can put a green roof on the north side of 21,000
22 feet, we will put a green roof there.

23 If it is more efficient to put a
24 reflective roof that will capture the water, and
25 that's what will capture the water and reuse that

1 water, that's what we plan to do.

2 So I just wanted to clarify. This
3 wasn't one of those, no, I don't want to pay for
4 this thing. So we will do it again.

5 Thanks.

6 MR. MARSDEN: If I may, just to add to
7 that question a little bit.

8 My understanding is you are going to
9 collect the water from the roof, store it in a tank,
10 and then that tank will overflow into the detention
11 system underneath.

12 I think the question was if you are
13 going to have, you said 50,000 gallons originally of
14 water stored, where is that storage tank going to
15 be, because that is a significant sized tank?

16 MR. AHMED: It's going to be in the
17 garage -- that could also be in the actual holding
18 outside. The tank doesn't have to be horizontal.
19 The tank could be vertical.

20 MR. MARSDEN: But I'm just saying, you
21 know --

22 MR. AHMED: Oh, we have a 35-foot
23 clearance in there. Once again, if we showed it on
24 the plan, we are kind of married to the location.
25 We are going to find a spot for this thing. We have

1 a 21,000 foot building with 35-foot ceilings. I
2 think it's ample enough.

3 MR. MINERVINI: We have lots of space
4 for these tanks, and assuming approval, they could
5 all be shown post engineering, but we have lots of
6 space. We have 35-foot ceilings in some sections
7 that these tanks could be in. It doesn't have to be
8 one tank. It could be multiple.

9 VICE CHAIR GREENE: You wouldn't be
10 replacing parking spots?

11 MR. MINERVINI: We're not going to be
12 replacing parking spaces. That we can commit to.

13 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Thank you.

14 Anything else from the public?

15 Seeing none, can I have a motion to
16 close?

17 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Motion to close
18 the public portion.

19 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Second.

20 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Thanks.

21 All in favor?

22 (All Board members answered in the
23 affirmative.)

24 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Good.

25 Mr. Matule, we are at twenty of ten.

1 You have two more witnesses?

2 MR. MATULE: I do. I have my traffic,
3 and I have my planner.

4 We have committed the evening to this,
5 and I am not suggesting at all that we stay until,
6 you know, the wee hours of the morning, but do you
7 think we can get through the testimony efficiently
8 and wrap it up?

9 We have a lot of people in the room.

10 MR. MATULE: I do. Obviously I don't
11 have any control over the public portion at the end,
12 but I would think my traffic and my planner are
13 maybe 45 minutes max.

14 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Let's plow ahead.

15 We will take a ten-minute break. At
16 ten to ten, we will resume.

17 MR. MATULE: Thank you.

18 (Recess taken.)

19 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Hello.

20 Okay. It is about ten o'clock. We are
21 back on the record.

22 Mr. Matule?

23 MR. MATULE: Mr. Staigar?

24 MR. GALVIN: I guess he is here to tell
25 us about the bowling lanes?

1 (Laughter)

2 Tough ordinance.

3 (Laughter)

4 Raise your right hand, Mr. Staigar.

5 Do you swear to tell the truth, the
6 whole truth, and nothing but the truth, so help you
7 God?

8 MR. STAIGAR: Yes, I do.

9 J O S E P H S T A I G A R, having been duly sworn,
10 testified as follows:

11 MR. GALVIN: Mr. Chairman, do we accept
12 Mr. Staigar's credentials as an expert in traffic
13 engineering?

14 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Yes, we do.

15 MR. GALVIN: You're good to go.

16 MR. MATULE: Mr. Staigar, you prepared
17 a report, dated March 27th, 2013, that was submitted
18 as part of this application?

19 THE WITNESS: Yes.

20 MR. MATULE: And you are aware there
21 has been some modification to the plan since you
22 prepared that report, right?

23 THE WITNESS: Yes.

24 MR. MATULE: Could you go through your
25 report for the Board and give us your professional

1 opinion regarding the traffic issues, the trip
2 generation, the level of service at the
3 intersections, et cetera, with respect to the
4 proposed project?

5 THE WITNESS: Yes.

6 I just want to preface it that it was
7 based on a smaller -- smaller original units, 267,
8 and we are now at 296, and the retail being 4200,
9 and now we are 54,000, and I will address those
10 differential units and square footage as it relates
11 to trip generation.

12 All we did is we went out -- the first
13 step was when we went out and took traffic counts,
14 we had pretty good historic data in this area. We
15 have taken counts at these intersections surrounding
16 the site back in 2009, 2011, and then most recently
17 last year, 2013, at the intersections of Madison
18 Street with 13th Street, with Jefferson Street, with
19 13th and also at 15th Street, so we got that
20 inventory of what is happening during the peak
21 hours.

22 The major thoroughfare in this area is
23 not Jefferson Street obviously. It's not 13th. It
24 is Madison Street of which we have primarily
25 northbound movements in the morning and southbound

1 movements, heavy movements in the evening.

2 Those movements are in the order of
3 about 350 going northbound, and about 150 going
4 southbound in the morning, and then reverse flow in
5 the evening peak hours.

6 Those peak hours happen between the
7 hours of seven and nine a.m., and four to six p.m.,
8 typical rush hours that we deal with.

9 The next step was how much traffic will
10 this site generate.

11 Now, it has been a warehouse in the
12 past. Currently it is used as a parking structure
13 for surrounding uses in the area. It is
14 currently -- it has and it currently is generating
15 traffic, some level of traffic.

16 As a warehouse, it would generate in
17 the order of 25 trips during the morning peak hour,
18 and the p.m. peak hour as a parking garage, it
19 generates more than that during those peak hours as
20 a turnover of parking spaces occurs.

21 That potential or existing volume will
22 be removed from the site and replaced with the 296
23 units and 50 residential units and 54,000 square
24 feet of commercial development.

25 Now, the commercial development will

1 primarily be what I consider either like
2 entertainment type of or a recreational type of use
3 being the bowling alley and the rock climbing venue,
4 but we also have more conventional retail on this
5 site, as you heard from Mr. Minervini as well.

6 What we had done was we had utilized
7 trip generation rates as if it was a shopping
8 center, retail use. It is the worst case scenario.
9 It generates the most traffic, and taking that into
10 consideration gives us a relatively high number,
11 probably an unrealistically high number, but we
12 utilized it as a base to determine how much traffic
13 this site would generate, so we have that for the
14 54,000 square feet.

15 For 296 units, we also use trip
16 generation rates that are -- I will call them
17 suburban in nature. And then we -- what we have
18 done is based on U.S. census data, based on our own
19 information, traffic counts that we have taken
20 throughout the city, sitting at garages at some of
21 your more residential developments in the site
22 counting cars and determining what the Hoboken
23 characteristics are in trip generation to relate to
24 those numbers.

25 What we found was that if we did not

1 adjust the volumes, if we considered this shopping
2 center, like a shopping center on Route 22 in Union,
3 New Jersey or a highway location, and the
4 residential units also being of a suburban nature,
5 we could generate about 146 trips in the morning and
6 326 trips in the p.m. peak hour.

7 We know this site is not going to
8 operate that way from our own empirical data, but
9 also from your city information as well, the U.S.
10 census data.

11 Hoboken is a walkable, bicycling,
12 commuting by mass transit community. More than half
13 of your residents don't drive their own motor
14 vehicles to and from work. They use other means to
15 do so, and so we have adjusted it based on that.

16 We also adjusted the retail use of the
17 site that there will be some internal trip
18 relationships, meaning that the stores, the
19 entertainment center, whether it is rock climbing,
20 or recreational, or the bowling alley, or some of
21 the social aspects of the commercial use will be
22 utilized by these 296 units, the residents that will
23 live in there, so that you have some internal
24 activity.

25 We also know that we will be in a

1 location that some of the residents will walk
2 obviously to the commercial uses as well, a
3 characteristic that you won't find out on a highway
4 location. So we made those adjustments to establish
5 internal and what we call pass-by trips in order to
6 adjust those volumes.

7 So the numbers I just gave you, the 146
8 trips in the morning, and the 326 trips in the
9 afternoon, we adjusted them to 80 trips in the
10 morning, and 125 trips in the afternoon.

11 We have taken those numbers, and we
12 superimposed that on to the existing volumes on the
13 roadways to determine the levels of service and
14 found that if once we have done that, intersections
15 in the immediate area that of Madison Street and
16 13th and Jefferson and 13th will operate at good
17 levels of service, level of service C or better, A,
18 B and C. Where ranges are from A to F, we are in
19 the A, B, C range.

20 Beyond the site, there will be good
21 dispersion given the relatively good grid system of
22 your street system in and around the area.

23 The location of the site is somewhat
24 particular in that it is located in the northwest
25 quadrant. It is along Madison Street, which is that

1 westerly, I will call it the connector road,
2 arterial, that brings traffic sort of around the
3 perimeter to get into and out of the city, probably
4 one of your least congested sections of the city in
5 terms of getting in and out of the city or utilizing
6 that roadway to get through the city itself.

7 So I think that most of the traffic
8 that will be oriented to the site certainly is able
9 to get out onto Madison, onto 13th Street, and onto
10 Jefferson Street in that A, B, C range, and then
11 beyond that, we are able to use the grid system
12 beyond that in order to weave through the city
13 without and dispersing -- I shouldn't say the word
14 "Weave" -- but disperse beyond those particular
15 points that they need to utilize to get in and out
16 of the city.

17 In the actual traffic study, we
18 utilized 79 a.m. trips and 196 p.m. trips in order
19 to establish the levels of service that are in the
20 report. The numbers that utilizing the actual --
21 and you will see in the discussion in the report, I
22 did not make those specific adjustments to the -- to
23 the trip generation, which are valid adjustments,
24 Hoboken adjustments I will call them and
25 characteristics of pass by and internal trips.

1 So the 79 trips in the a.m. relate to
2 the 80 trips that I just testified to with the
3 higher number of units and square footage, and we
4 utilized 196 trips, which more likely would be 125
5 trips with the higher units and the higher square
6 footage.

7 So the results in the report still
8 remain valid, even though the numbers changed and
9 point out that, again, we are in that A, B, C range
10 with a good chunk, a good level of reserve capacity
11 to allow for any deviations that there might be in
12 the actual projections of what the trip generations
13 are.

14 The last aspect was looking at the
15 site, the internal circulation, the access in and
16 out of the site, parking, the parking spaces, how it
17 is laid out.

18 There are three points of access to the
19 site. The northerly access point and the southernly
20 access point brings us down to the first level. 155
21 parking spaces that will be self-park. They will be
22 oriented more to the retail and commercial use of
23 the site and will be signed on the exterior of the
24 site for that.

25 The middle driveway will bring us

1 upstairs on the upper level, the second level, where
2 you will have the triple stack parking spaces,
3 the 288 triple stacked spaces, and that will be the
4 valet area where you won't park yourself. A person
5 who would drive in and come up the ramp and stage in
6 the -- I will call it the middle aisle.

7 There is a 22-foot aisle in this area.
8 You could have a line of cars along -- at least
9 along one edge there, where somebody would drop the
10 car off, or the valet person would use that as a
11 reservoir area, so to speak. So if you had two or
12 three cars that all came in at once with only one or
13 two valet persons, if it is in the off hour, maybe
14 only one, they could align those cars up, and then
15 as that rush of cars subsides, then utilize that
16 time period to bring them into the stackers and load
17 them up. So you do have this long alleyway, I will
18 call it, as a reservoir area for any influx of a
19 number of cars that may come in.

20 This will be a parking management plan.
21 It is not finalized yet. It is always going to be a
22 work in progress, but it will be one that obviously
23 you can hire and have on staff more valet parkers
24 during the peak periods, the peak periods when
25 residents maybe want to use their car in the morning

1 to leave the site, drop it off in the evening, and
2 then have the higher numbers of ins and outs.

3 There will need to be a balance between
4 the demand of parking. Obviously 288 parking spaces
5 for 296 space units might be a little too heavy, and
6 you always have empty spaces in here. How those
7 will be utilized, probably the staff and the
8 employees of the commercial will be able to park
9 there. But for the most part the public, the
10 general public, will utilize the first floor area to
11 park, and it will be directed to those areas and
12 self-park their own car at that location.

13 Maybe they will be offered some of the
14 valet parking and have the option to valet park, but
15 most public people, if they have the option, will
16 probably choose to park their own vehicle,
17 particularly if they are doing some sort of shopping
18 or out on a social event to utilize some of the
19 commercial space on the site.

20 So (a) you have more than parking, as
21 you heard from Mr. Minervini, we exceed your parking
22 standards. I think the numbers we provide 431 --
23 I'm sorry -- we provide 443, but require only 431.

24 And the one thing about that, that is
25 if the residential parking peak at the same time

1 that the retail peaked and actually what they will
2 be, they will be offset. As the residential peaks
3 at night, and as the day morning goes on, and the
4 day goes on, by midday it is at its minimum when the
5 commercial may indeed be at one of its peaks.

6 So they kind of off peak with one
7 another, so that the 443 parking spaces will be
8 more -- be more excess there, because the shared
9 parking arrangement that partially you will have
10 will work that out in terms of the non coincidental
11 peak depends on the two types of uses, which a
12 shared parking arrangement is very compatible with
13 residential and retail uses, so there is more than
14 sufficient parking on the site, which would allow
15 for some leeway for the valet people and the parking
16 management plan to operate that much more simpler.

17 We will have some loading areas on the
18 site. Right now they are located on the first
19 floor.

20 Mr. Marsden made a good point of having
21 access and getting in and out of those spaces. We
22 will have to show that an SU-30 truck coming into
23 the site and being able to maneuver into those
24 parking spaces. We will have to make some
25 adjustments, if they can't. But I think we will

1 have -- we will be able to work something out with
2 them.

3 So we have four loading areas on the
4 site for those types of deliveries to get them off
5 the street. We also have the option to request from
6 the city a loading zone along Madison Street
7 primarily, but with the interior loading areas, I
8 don't think that will be necessary at all, and that
9 is my testimony.

10 MR. MATULE: Just one other thing.

11 There was some discussion earlier on
12 during Mr. Minervini's testimony about handicapped
13 parking spaces.

14 THE WITNESS: Yes.

15 MR. MATULE: Can you just talk to that
16 point?

17 THE WITNESS: Yes.

18 Well, it is very questionable, and I
19 can't exactly remember what the law is, but from a
20 practical standpoint, we have 443 parking spaces.
21 We probably do need about ten or eleven parking
22 spaces, but the fact that they are being valeted and
23 the handicapped person is not occupying that space,
24 that in the valet parking arrangement, that
25 handicapped person would pull out in the aisle and

1 utilize the aisle as a handicapped accessibility,
2 leave the vehicle, and then have the valet pick it
3 up after that. There is access, you know, near the
4 entrance way on both the north side of that valet
5 parking area, that these parking spaces do not need
6 handicapped spaces. The only spaces that we need
7 handicapped spaces for from a practical standpoint
8 is the 155 on the first level, where if a
9 handicapped person does enter and needs to park
10 their vehicle, they are going to park it themselves.

11 We do have and we do have handicapped
12 accessible spaces, where they abut striping at one,
13 two, three, four, five handicapped spaces.

14 Typically when you get over a certain
15 amount, I don't know exactly what the table is, but
16 when you go over a certain amount, I believe it is
17 over a hundred parking spaces, you need two percent.

18 So if we have 155 parking spaces, two
19 percent of that is four spaces, so we have more than
20 ample parking for handicapped accessibility.

21 MR. MARSDEN: If I may just interrupt.

22 The spaces you are saying are stripped,
23 they are encroached or encumbered by the bicycle
24 racks, so they can't be used for handicapped
25 parking?

1 THE WITNESS: Yes. We will have to
2 move them. At least one of them will have to be van
3 accessible, which I believe we have at the lower
4 right-hand corner. And the other ones, as long as
5 they have five feet next to eight feet -- and some
6 of these spaces are, in fact, nine foot eight
7 inches, so we need a 13-foot space.

8 So if it is already nine foot eight
9 inches, we need another three foot three inches. I
10 think we have that, got enough room there for that.

11 So I agree with Jeff. We will have to
12 maybe adjust some of our bike racks, maybe one bike
13 rack will make an adjustment, but that is about it.

14 As long as we have the van accessible,
15 which is 16 foot for the actual parking space, and
16 the stripped area, and the remainder needs 13 feet,
17 eight and five, we have that availability to provide
18 it, and those details will be worked out in the
19 final plans.

20 MR. MATULE: And you will also, I think
21 you testified, you will do turning radius templates
22 to see if the trucks will get into those loading
23 zones?

24 THE WITNESS: Absolutely, yes. And we
25 will provide, again, those exhibits to the Board and

1 your professionals.

2 MR. MATULE: Okay.

3 MR. MARSDEN: If I may, turning
4 templates when you load them, assume you already
5 have one truck parked --

6 THE WITNESS: Yes.

7 MR. MARSDEN: -- because that will make
8 it much more difficult.

9 THE WITNESS: Yes, it will, and that is
10 the practical scenario also.

11 MR. MARSDEN: I'm sorry.

12 The other thing was if you are going to
13 be bringing people up the ramp, and you got
14 handicapped regulations that are very clear, your
15 handicapped should be closest to the handicapped
16 accessible space, so I would suggest at each
17 elevator on each side, you may get a handicapped
18 unloading area, so that the people go very directly
19 from the vehicle to the elevator access.

20 THE WITNESS: Right.

21 MR. MARSDEN: If you know what I am
22 talking about -- flip it up, Joe.

23 THE WITNESS: Well, this is the first
24 floor.

25 MR. MARSDEN: The top floor -- I am

1 saying, you can designate this, and this is a
2 handicapped because you have an elevator and an
3 elevator.

4 THE WITNESS: Correct.

5 MR. MARSDEN: And you need to have them
6 as close as possible to the elevators.

7 THE WITNESS: Absolutely, yes.

8 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Mr. Staigar, how does
9 one get to the building from Willow coming from the
10 north?

11 What's the traffic flow from Willow
12 into the building from the north, and then
13 conversely how do people get to Willow to go north
14 to the --

15 THE WITNESS: To get to Willow, you
16 would take 13th Street, which is one way going
17 westbound to Madison Street.

18 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: And what are the
19 traffic lights -- what are the lights, any --

20 THE WITNESS: No traffic lights. There
21 is no traffic light at Willow and 13th -- no, there
22 is one at mid block. I think it is at the Rite Aid,
23 it's at that driveway. I don't think it's at 13th
24 Street.

25 MR. MATULE: No. It is at 12th, and

1 12th is --

2 THE WITNESS: One way going eastbound.

3 MR. MATULE: -- east, yes.

4 THE WITNESS: So there is no traffic
5 light at 13th, along 13th or Madison.

6 VICE CHAIR GREENE: But -- no, go
7 ahead, I'm sorry.

8 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: I am just trying to,
9 you know, I only lived here --

10 THE WITNESS: So you would come down
11 Willow either northbound or southbound and make a
12 left or a right onto 13th Street, which brings you
13 to Madison, make a right into the driveway, the
14 driveway here.

15 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: So is 13th Street at
16 the CVS --

17 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Rite Aid.

18 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: -- Rite Aid?

19 MR. MATULE: Rite Aid, yes.

20 THE WITNESS: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: And it is westbound?

22 MR. MATULE: Yes. I actually just
23 drove down it this morning.

24 VICE CHAIR GREENE: I think 13th is
25 actually the driveway, isn't it?

1 COMMISSIONER MURPHY: I was going to
2 say, I don't think it's a through street.

3 VICE CHAIR GREENE: It's not a through
4 street, is it?

5 COMMISSIONER FISHER: No. I actually
6 think it's an odd through street.

7 MR. GALVIN: Wait. Everyone hold on.
8 One voice at a time, all right?

9 MR. MATULE: South of the Rite Aid,
10 where the -- I don't know what type of public --

11 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Fox Hill.

12 MR. MATULE: -- Fox Towers is, you can
13 make a right there, and go west.

14 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay.

15 MR. MATULE: I only know because I
16 drove past the site on the way into town this
17 morning, and that is exactly how I went.

18 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: So there is no traffic
19 light at 13th?

20 MR. MATULE: No.

21 THE WITNESS: No, not at that specific
22 intersection.

23 MR. MATULE: There is actually a
24 traffic light, because 13th is like a dog leg.
25 There is a traffic light in front of the exit to the

1 Rite Aid on the north side of the Rite Aid, like
2 where Dean Marchetto's office is on the corner there
3 and the Sunoco station, there is a light there, but
4 you would be going through that light and then make
5 the right past Fox Towers.

6 THE WITNESS: I think, and --

7 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Let's go the opposite
8 way.

9 THE WITNESS: -- I think you can take
10 15th Street as well, and that takes you to
11 Madison --

12 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Take a right on
13 15th.

14 THE WITNESS: -- and take a right onto
15 15th and make a left.

16 And then reverse flow, because 15th is
17 a two-way street, as is Madison, so you can get to
18 Willow Street either way.

19 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: So have you done any
20 studies for the traffic patterns at 15th Street or
21 13th Street?

22 THE WITNESS: Yes, we have. At 13th
23 and Jefferson, 13th and Madison, and then Madison
24 and 15th Street.

25 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: I am sort of inquiring

1 about the Willow Street --

2 THE WITNESS: Oh, no. We hadn't done
3 it for this project, no.

4 COMMISSIONER FISHER: For what street?

5 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Willow.

6 THE WITNESS: Willow and 15th?

7 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Willow and 15th,
8 Willow and 13th.

9 THE WITNESS: Well, Willow and 13th, I
10 had done for -- I don't know if it was this Board or
11 the Planning Board for Advanced Realty. We had
12 studied it for that one, and had that ample --
13 because what you are doing there on 13th Street, you
14 are either making a right turn or a left turn.
15 Nothing is coming out of 13th Street on the westerly
16 side of Willow Street because it is a one-way going
17 westbound.

18 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Do you want to keep
19 going, because I am not quite finished, so go ahead.

20 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Yeah. No, go
21 ahead.

22 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay. Well, again,
23 you know, we hear good studies about the impact of
24 traffic surrounding a property, but what I don't
25 understand -- I don't hear from our traffic planners

1 for the most part is what are the incremental
2 impacts on traffic coming in and out of town.

3 I think anybody who has been in town
4 long enough is going to say anecdotally, the traffic
5 is getting awful on Willow in particular, Park going
6 in and out of town.

7 So my question is sort of a broader
8 one: At what point does an incremental project like
9 this, you know, affect adversely the traffic that we
10 are already experiencing?

11 THE WITNESS: Yeah, and that is a good
12 point. And some people may say one car is going to
13 break the stack of cars, or somebody will say it
14 will be like 500.

15 What the Institute of Transportation
16 Engineers recommends, as the DOT recommends, is that
17 if you increase it by more than a hundred trips per
18 hour, you have a potential of having a significant
19 impact on a particular intersection. We are talking
20 about in the order -- in the p.m. peak hour of 125
21 additional trips coming in and out of our site, but
22 they are not all headed to Willow Street. They are
23 not all headed to 15th and Willow or 13th and
24 Willow.

25 They could be utilizing Madison Street

1 to get to the south end, or they could weave -- I
2 hate to use the word "weave" - but disperse using
3 your grid system street of using any of one of those
4 streets to get to where they need to go.

5 So, again, there will be good
6 dispersion once you leave the confines of the
7 intersections that I did study, Jefferson and 13th,
8 Madison and 13th, and Madison and 15th Street.

9 Beyond that, they will be dispersed,
10 but the point is that you will not have any
11 intersection that will increase by a hundred trips
12 per hour beyond, again, beyond the site, which we
13 did study, and probably in the order of much less
14 than 50 trips per hour having an increase.

15 So rather than going out and studying
16 each and every individual intersection, we only
17 surmise that we are located at a location that we
18 have analyzed the direct -- the intersections that
19 have a direct impact, and beyond that, you will have
20 dispersion enough, that it will be lessened as you
21 get further and further from the site itself.

22 I hope that answers your question.

23 But, again, a hundred trips per hour is
24 pretty much the defined limit of where you will have
25 an impact and where you won't have an impact, or at

1 least a potential impact or no impact, and beyond
2 these intersections that we studied will be far less
3 than a hundred trips per hour increase.

4 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: But that is focusing
5 on this particular property. It doesn't take into
6 account when Advanced comes on line, and I can't
7 remember whether there are 300 or 400 parking spots
8 there. It's at the corner of Willow and 14th
9 Street.

10 You know, I have experienced increased
11 traffic coming down the Viaduct, and obviously some
12 of it may be construction related, but at some point
13 it would be -- Frank is nodding because he lives
14 over there -- at some point it would be nice to have
15 a study of what our town can absorb.

16 THE WITNESS: Yeah. It is always a
17 moving target, and there's always mitigating
18 factors.

19 I know I just read information from New
20 Jersey Transit that they are looking at a new light
21 rail station in around this north edge. Where it is
22 exactly going to be, they don't know exactly. But,
23 again, it is not something that is set in concrete,
24 nor is the Advanced project. I mean, it is approved
25 and it is going to be built. It's probably moving

1 on. When it will ever happen, nobody knows. When
2 other developments -- but there are other mitigating
3 factors, such as that light rail.

4 If the demand is such that you need
5 that light rail, well, certainly New Jersey Transit
6 will move that much more faster implementing it,
7 again, to offset many of these impacts as they are
8 developed.

9 VICE CHAIR GREENE: In your testimony
10 you referred to a relatively good grid.

11 What exactly does that mean?

12 THE WITNESS: Well, if I take any one
13 of your streets to get out of town, I could probably
14 choose a dozen or more routes in order to get out of
15 your city.

16 VICE CHAIR GREENE: At two o'clock in
17 the morning.

18 What about at eight o'clock in the
19 morning or at six o'clock in the evening?

20 THE WITNESS: What I'm saying is I
21 don't need to use Willow Street or Park Street to go
22 from the north end or the south end. I can use
23 Garden, Clinton, Jefferson, Madison, Monroe, Adams,
24 and the same thing. In order to get from the east
25 side to the west side, I don't need to use First

1 Street. I could use Second Street, Third Street,
2 Fourth Street.

3 What I am saying is that you have many
4 alternate routes that if one gets bogged down, and
5 you don't want to drive, and you feel
6 inconvenienced, you have that ability to make a
7 right and then a left and get on another street to
8 get you to the place where you want to go.

9 Your city is set up as a grid system,
10 and I am not confined to one way or two streets --

11 VICE CHAIR GREENE: So you are
12 describing the physical street layout. You are not
13 describing whether or not they are congested or
14 over-utilized or under-utilized. Your reference to
15 good is a physical description of the way our
16 streets are laid out?

17 THE WITNESS: Yes. That you have
18 options that if one street is congested because
19 school is letting out or there is some activity
20 that's happening there, that you have many other
21 options to utilize to get to where you want to go.

22 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Okay.

23 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: My only concern is we
24 all end up at the same two points coming in and out
25 of the city.

1 THE WITNESS: I think it is five
2 points. Those are the bottlenecks, I agree with
3 you.

4 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Thank you.
5 Anybody else?

6 COMMISSIONER FISHER: I do.
7 My apologies. I am slightly confused
8 because this whole report was based on all of the
9 entrances on Jefferson, right?

10 The report that I am looking at --

11 THE WITNESS: No.

12 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- I can't
13 imagine I have an old one, but the one I have is --
14 it says March 27th, 2013 at the bottom, received May
15 13th, 2014 --

16 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: That's the one.

17 THE WITNESS: But --

18 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- if you go to
19 the first page, it says: Vehicular access to the
20 development is proposed via one full movement
21 driveway along Jefferson Street --

22 THE WITNESS: Okay. That's --

23 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- and then all
24 of your intersections that you reference and all of
25 the numbers in here are Jefferson Street, so I am

1 struggling a little to reconcile Jefferson Street,
2 which is not a thoroughfare like Madison is --

3 THE WITNESS: If I may, where did you
4 read that?

5 COMMISSIONER FISHER: I'm reading -- if
6 you want to --

7 COMMISSIONER MURPHY: Second
8 paragraph --

9 THE WITNESS: Second paragraph of the
10 very first page?

11 COMMISSIONER FISHER: The first page,
12 the second paragraph says -- that last sentence:
13 Vehicular access to the development is proposed via
14 one full movement driveway along Jefferson.

15 Then on the next page it goes on to say
16 that you did the -- when you did the traffic
17 conditions, you looked at Jefferson Street
18 intersections with 13th and 15th, but you don't
19 mention Madison anywhere.

20 And when you look at the actual maps in
21 the back, there is no inter -- Madison isn't even on
22 your maps in the back.

23 THE WITNESS: Okay. Do you have a
24 Figure 4?

25 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Yeah.

1 THE WITNESS: No. Figure 4 looks like
2 this in the back.

3 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Is it the very
4 last --

5 THE WITNESS: At the end -- not the
6 very last -- you see the figure numbers up on the
7 upper right-hand corner?

8 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Yeah.

9 THE WITNESS: Let me --

10 MR. MARSDEN: Here is the Figure 4. It
11 has not been updated.

12 THE WITNESS: Yes. This is the -- you
13 don't have the updated report.

14 MR. MATULE: I think the problem is
15 that, and I apologize, because I am not in
16 possession of one either, apparently the report was
17 undated, and I didn't receive an updated report to
18 distribute to the Board.

19 We can certainly copy and distribute
20 it, but that is what he was testifying to.

21 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Well, let me --
22 okay -- from -- as you were testifying, and you were
23 saying numbers, I was trying to compare it with what
24 was in the report, so I am not a hundred percent
25 clear on some of it, so let me just ask a couple of

1 questions.

2 One: Did you -- I thought you said
3 originally, hum, as it related to Madison Street,
4 did you -- did you make a comment about how many
5 cars -- just generally car traffic is on Madison
6 right now?

7 I think you said like 150 and 350,
8 something like that?

9 THE WITNESS: Well, 150 in the -- I'll
10 give you the correct --

11 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Okay.

12 THE WITNESS: -- so I rounded the
13 numbers off. We are about 300 going northbound in
14 the morning, and 150 going southbound in the
15 morning. And then the reverse flow happens, where
16 you have 150 going northbound in the p.m. peak hour,
17 and 300 going southbound in the p.m. peak hour.

18 Those are just round about numbers.
19 You know, the numbers are actually a little bit less
20 than that, but you get the flavor of how much
21 traffic.

22 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Okay.

23 So they seem like big numbers, if
24 you're -- correct me if I am wrong, if you're
25 talking about the addition of a hundred potentially

1 would raise concerns or you would be concerned
2 about --

3 THE WITNESS: 20 percent increase.

4 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- yeah.

5 So just this one building on Madison,
6 you are suggesting that number or more, just one
7 building.

8 So all of these cars probably within
9 multiple blocks are going along.

10 There is no stop signs, no traffic
11 lights, and there is -- on Madison there is no
12 traffic lights, and that stretch of Madison, I am
13 not sure there's -- I'm not sure when you hit a stop
14 sign on Madison. I mean, it's a pretty long
15 stretch. I mean, it is a pretty big, I take it, and
16 again, I come from the Hudson Tea Building, and I
17 take that as my northern to get to, you know, 1&9.

18 It seems like a big increase just for
19 one building. You know, we -- kind of taking
20 Chairman Aibel's point further, that is a
21 significant increase for one building without even
22 knowing --

23 MR. GALVIN: You should focus on asking
24 questions --

25 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- I'll ask a

1 question --

2 MR. GALVIN: -- and not get into your
3 opinions yet.

4 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- okay. I will
5 save my opinion.

6 So my question is it's roughly a 30
7 percent increase, it sounds like, just for this
8 building, give or take?

9 THE WITNESS: I would say 25 --

10 COMMISSIONER FISHER: 25? All right.
11 25, 30.

12 THE WITNESS: -- but if there were two
13 cars on that roadway, and then it would be a
14 thousand percent increase or whatever, but the
15 relative numbers --

16 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Yup.

17 THE WITNESS: -- aren't as important as
18 the results of the capacity analysis --

19 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Sure.

20 THE WITNESS: -- because, right, if we
21 had 2000 cars on that roadway, and we were adding a
22 hundred, you could probably sit there and go, oh,
23 well, that is not so bad. It is only a five percent
24 increase --

25 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Well, but I

1 guess --

2 THE WITNESS: -- but the percent
3 increase I don't believe has any bearing in terms of
4 what can the road handle the increase in volume --

5 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- but a few
6 things, and we had some of these questions at the
7 last meeting that you were at.

8 One is when you think about 25 percent,
9 I'll use your number, in a short period of time
10 going from this building and having to get into that
11 traffic, I mean, do you have a safety issue?

12 There is no stop signs. There's
13 nothing. You have a hundred -- I would argue that
14 those 150 and 300 that are moving, they're moving at
15 a pretty rapid pace. This is not a street that has
16 stop signs on either corner.

17 So now you have an additional 25
18 percent coming in and out of this building into that
19 traffic. Do you have traffic concerns?

20 Do you have safety concerns?

21 THE WITNESS: The concern is if you
22 have that number, 300 and 150, do you have gaps in
23 traffic in order to accommodate the lefts and rights
24 coming in and out, and that was the -- that is at
25 the very end of the report, what is called a

1 Capacity Analysis --

2 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Uh-huh.

3 THE WITNESS: -- it establishes how
4 many gaps are on Madison Avenue, and how many
5 vehicles you are trying to process in and out of
6 Madison Avenue, and obviously it is more difficult
7 to make a left turn than it is a right turn.

8 It is a model of the intersection
9 itself, and then determines what the levels of
10 service are. If we are in the E, F range, we know
11 we have congestion. We know we have backups. We
12 know we have situations, where maybe people will
13 take a shorter gap in traffic because they are just
14 frustrated and can't wait any longer.

15 But what we found from doing those
16 capacity analyses, the volumes is really not that
17 heavy. 450 vehicles per hour, 300 and 150, is
18 really not a heavy volume.

19 If you consider there is 3600 seconds
20 in an hour, and if you are dealing with, let's round
21 it off to 400 vehicles per hour on that, that is if
22 you sat there on average, one car would pass every
23 nine seconds. There's nine seconds between each car
24 either coming from the left or coming from the
25 right. You need seven seconds to make a left-hand

1 turn from the driveway or from 13th Street, so I
2 could process 400 vehicles easily making left-hand
3 turns from 13th Street or from the driveway, so the
4 450 number is really not a high number at all.

5 So, again, the capacity analysis
6 dictates and determines whether we do have
7 sufficient gaps in traffic to allow safe movements
8 to and from the site, to and from the roadways
9 immediately.

10 While we may be increasing the number
11 by 125 at the site driveway, by that point a certain
12 percentage is going to go north. A certain
13 percentage is going to go south, so we have already
14 dispersed down to, let's say, 65 in either
15 direction.

16 The 125 going in and out are now 65
17 directly to the north and directly to the south.
18 Beyond that, it even disperses even further as you
19 are able to --

20 COMMISSIONER FISHER: And how does the
21 complexity --

22 THE WITNESS: -- use the system --

23 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- increase,
24 decrease when you have three driveways within one
25 city block pulling out and going left and right at

1 the same time?

2 THE WITNESS: I think you have
3 sufficient spacing from those driveways, and if the
4 driveways are not overly intensive in terms of
5 movements, then you have safe driveways.

6 These driveways, obviously the driveway
7 to the south is very much removed from the north,
8 and if Frank can help me with the scale -- 1/16th --
9 so I would say we have about five inches between the
10 driveways times 16, so we have about eight feet
11 between driveways. Again, I use the term.

12 One comparison I make is on a state
13 highway where you have 55 miles an hour, I am
14 allowed to put 24 feet. DOT determines that 24 feet
15 is a standard of a safe separation between
16 driveways. Here we have 80 feet.

17 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Do you -- is
18 there --

19 THE WITNESS: Go ahead, I'm sorry.

20 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- given that
21 volume, in your experience, would that volume or
22 projected volume, or what you think may happen
23 around the area merit or require stop signs or some
24 sort of traffic safety things in the corners?

25 Like at what --

1 THE WITNESS: You have a stop sign at
2 13th Street. That's controlled. At 13th Street,
3 you have a stop sign.

4 COMMISSIONER FISHER: On Madison,
5 though?

6 THE WITNESS: No. I think you want
7 Madison to be your thoroughfare, some type of
8 thoroughfare.

9 I think you want to be able to carry
10 those -- those volumes -- on Madison Street, the
11 volumes on Madison Street are much heavier than they
12 are on Jefferson, Clinton, and Adams, and all of the
13 other streets because it is your westerly roadway.
14 I think people gravitate to that road to get from
15 one end to the next, because they can do it with
16 relative ease. There is less friction along these
17 roads with pedestrian traffic and cars moving in and
18 out that you might see on some of the other interior
19 roadways.

20 So I don't think you want to have stop
21 signs unless there is an accident problem with
22 people speeding and carelessly driving along
23 Madison --

24 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Well, I mean --

25 THE WITNESS: -- but I don't see that.

1 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- a lot of --
2 but then an additional overlay on this is now you
3 have 300 -- I will round it -- 300 residential
4 units, probably 450-ish people, including families
5 and young kids, nannies, and you have a lot of
6 pedestrians that are in and around that building.

7 Now, I recognize that side of the
8 building may not be the primary place for people to
9 walk out or just, you know, recreational use, but it
10 may be to your point if we have another light rail
11 station or people choose to walk to one, people are
12 going to use that. So you have a high traffic
13 route, you have a lot more cars coming in and out of
14 the building turning left and right. You have
15 parks -- a good point -- under the Viaduct, there is
16 now a park, and I think Frank mentioned it is going
17 to be a basketball court, so I imagine there is
18 going to be a number of kids.

19 I mean, you just created a -- I'm going
20 to use the phrase density, that to me -- again, I
21 don't want to give an observation, but my question
22 is around: Is it safe enough?

23 Are we adding a lot more traffic into
24 an area, including pedestrian traffic, in creating
25 unnecessary risks or a risk that we have not

1 contemplated or accurately -- or effectively looked
2 at yet, potential safety issues?

3 THE WITNESS: I don't think so, because
4 the key aspect in terms of safety, the most
5 important aspect is the roadway designed
6 appropriately for sight distance.

7 Is there sufficient sight distance at
8 the intersections that we are dealing with,
9 driveways as well as the intersections, and I
10 believe that we are.

11 The building is set far back enough
12 that it is not within the sight line of 13th Street.
13 Somebody wanting to make a left-hand turn has the
14 availability to see cars traveling on Madison
15 Street.

16 This lane to the driveways, I don't
17 know, Frank talked about it, but, you know, there
18 may need to be certain mechanisms at the driveway,
19 such as the strobe lights, such as maybe a buzzer or
20 something to tell a pedestrian that, you know, the
21 gate is coming up, and somebody is leaving. That is
22 pretty typical here in the city.

23 One aspect since 13th Street is a
24 through -- it is a "T" intersection and stops at
25 Madison, it would be kind of unnatural to allow

1 this, to have 13th Street to have right-of-way and
2 stop vehicles on Madison Street, but maybe the next
3 street at 12th, which is a through street, because
4 you could reverse the stop signs.

5 Much the same way as you do on the
6 interior street. You don't want one or two streets
7 to have no stop signs because everybody will go
8 flying down that street. You want them to be forced
9 to be stopped at maybe alternating streets or such.

10 In the future, as traffic volumes and
11 activities increase, that might be an alternative to
12 reverse the stop signs at 12th Street to slow that
13 traffic down.

14 But you make a good point. That is one
15 of the mechanisms that could be implemented in order
16 to slow traffic down, if there is a speeding problem
17 along Madison.

18 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Is there -- one
19 other question -- is there -- I notice that you did
20 these counts. You did the Madison Street counts in
21 2013?

22 THE WITNESS: Yes. We did them in
23 2009, 2011 and in 2013.

24 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Okay.

25 Is the -- but 2013 was -- I think you

1 indicated the Viaduct was -- the project was there,
2 so the numbers were probably lower. Is that --

3 THE WITNESS: On Jefferson Street it
4 was closed. Jefferson Street had been closed.

5 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Okay, yeah, but
6 Madison --

7 THE WITNESS: That's always been open.

8 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- is -- do your
9 numbers take into consideration all of the
10 developments that have been built since 2009, 2011
11 and 2013, in that area, or any changes that
12 occurred --

13 THE WITNESS: Yes.

14 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- the Beer
15 Garden would be an example. I think it opened after
16 2011.

17 THE WITNESS: Yes.

18 Well, we took counts in 2013, so we
19 took into account the Beer Garden.

20 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Okay.

21 THE WITNESS: One thing we did also, we
22 increased the annual growth rate by 2.25 percent,
23 which was actually the old growth rate. It has now
24 been down -- lessened to one percent per year --

25 MR. GALVIN: Downgraded.

1 THE WITNESS: Downgraded.

2 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Downgraded.

3 You know, I saw that, and I have seen
4 that in other ones before. I think that is
5 interesting.

6 But when you think about Hoboken and
7 the population growth rate and specifically the
8 potential growth rate in this area given it's all up
9 for grabs, do you think that one percent or two
10 percent is really the right rate to use for growth?

11 THE WITNESS: Well, what I found was
12 that the -- if I had a level of service E or F, and
13 I was on the border line of being a failure or not
14 at these intersections --

15 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Uh-huh.

16 THE WITNESS: -- I would put more
17 weight into it. But the fact that we are in the A,
18 B, C range, there is a large percentage of reserve
19 capacity.

20 I could probably double the volumes on
21 Madison Street and still have a level of service D,
22 which is still acceptable.

23 So, again, I had a good margin of error
24 or a margin of safety in that number, so it could
25 sway one way the other, and I would still have good

1 levels of service.

2 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Can I get one
3 more question?

4 My last question -- my last question
5 comes back to, I -- I appreciate that you have
6 loading zones in the building, which is great,
7 because we have not seen that on some prior ones.

8 THE WITNESS: We got to make sure they
9 work. That's all. To prove that to Jeff --

10 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Yes. We have to
11 make sure that they work, that they are not just a
12 little cubbyhole in the corner.

13 The -- but what have you anticipated,
14 or how are you anticipating or incorporating the
15 potential delivery and ancillary activity for a
16 building of this scale?

17 THE WITNESS: I'm not following.

18 COMMISSIONER FISHER: So in your -- in
19 your traffic counts, they're predominantly
20 individuals with cars that either live in the
21 building or are visiting the building for retail in
22 the commercial uses.

23 But what we have found in other
24 buildings, including the one I live in, is there is
25 a whole kind of business -- there's a whole support

1 system that requires not only deliveries, but just
2 lots and lots of vehicles come to the building,
3 right?

4 There's contractors. There's -- you
5 know, for every --

6 THE WITNESS: Service, maintenance,
7 deliveries --

8 COMMISSIONER FISHER: -- services --
9 yeah, all of that.

10 Deliveries, small deliveries, big
11 deliveries, furniture, you name it, and there is a
12 lot of it.

13 So how do you think about that in the
14 context of your traffic studies or how should we?

15 THE WITNESS: A loading zone -- four
16 loading zones for a relatively small retail could be
17 4,000 square feet, which is a lot of loading zones,
18 a lot of loading areas.

19 If we had one or two, that would
20 probably be sufficient, so I think four is more than
21 sufficient.

22 The safety battle, I will call it, as
23 Mr. Minervini had pointed out, we could ask for a
24 loading zone along Madison Street. If these four,
25 and we may have vehicles larger, at times we may

1 have vehicles larger than the SU-30 box truck. Then
2 we might need a loading zone for those larger
3 trucks, even if it is a temporary basis or on a time
4 frame of -- I know there are loading zones here in
5 the city between nine and seven p.m. or some other
6 time frame.

7 If the demand requires, if there is
8 going to be a user. I don't think a bowling alley
9 is one that needs tractor trailers to arrive --

10 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Uh-huh.

11 THE WITNESS: -- and certainly, I will
12 call them corporate users, and CVS and 7-Elevens,
13 and Dunkin' Donuts may have small tractor trailers
14 that come to deliver.

15 I am not anticipating that type of
16 tenant in this building, but if there was one that
17 needed one, we would have to accommodate it by
18 soliciting the city. If the city doesn't grant it,
19 then that tenant probably wouldn't utilize that
20 space, so there is a check and balance that allows
21 for those types of scenarios.

22 But I think the four loading areas will
23 probably work. We are 99 percent confident that
24 that will be more than sufficient to accommodate
25 this building.

1 COMMISSIOENR FISHER: Thanks.

2 THE WTINESS: Thanks.

3 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Did you use specific
4 assumptions for the volume created by the particular
5 use that is being proposed, the bowling alley, that
6 if this becomes sensationally successful and
7 attracts people from out of town, I think we didn't
8 ask about the hours of operation, but it operates
9 through rush hour --

10 THE WTINESS: I considered it as a
11 shopping center. So if the bowling alley goes away,
12 and 7-Eleven, and Dunkin' Donuts, and the sandwich
13 shops and the Chinese restaurants and everything
14 else goes in there, that is what I considered, and I
15 think a bowling alley on a square foot basis is
16 probably much less intensive than those types of
17 retail uses.

18 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Except for the rock
19 and roll concerts.

20 THE WITNESS: Which hopefully --

21 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: You don't have to
22 answer that.

23 THE WITNESS: -- which aren't going to
24 be a seven to nine a.m. or a four to six p.m.
25 activity.

1 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: I have nothing more.

2 Anybody else?

3 Board members?

4 MS. BANYRA: I have one question.

5 Mr. Staigar, did I hear you, when you
6 started out, I think you said for warehouses, there
7 were 25 trips in the morning and 25 trips in the
8 afternoon?

9 THE WITNESS: Yes.

10 If this building was reutilized as it
11 has been in the past as a warehouse, and the one
12 thing we know, there are going to be tractor
13 trailers coming into that warehouse most likely as
14 well.

15 So I just gave the sheer numbers, but
16 you will have a significant amount of truck traffic
17 on a daily basis that would be generated by the
18 warehouse, so it is not like it was a vacant piece
19 of property that was never utilized before.

20 It is a parking garage now. It was a
21 warehouse. It is creating traffic currently that
22 will be removed from the equation, but yes, we will
23 have this project taking its place and then
24 generating those numbers, but the net result isn't
25 the actual numbers that are going in and out of this

1 proposed site.

2 MS. BANYRA: No. But they are
3 significantly more, though.

4 THE WITNESS: Oh, yeah. No doubt.

5 MS. BANYRA: I wasn't sure if I had
6 heard that correctly.

7 THE WITNESS: Yes.

8 MS. BANYRA: The second question I have
9 is regarding Madison Street and the community has
10 tried for many years to get a green circuit around
11 the back of town.

12 I think Commissioner Fisher has talked
13 to you -- asked you about the safety on Madison
14 Street, if Madison Street included a bike lane.

15 Part of our green circuit was supposed
16 to go along the light rail. I don't know that
17 that's ever going to happen. But if there were bike
18 lanes or something proposed, would your answer
19 regarding the Madison Street stop signs,
20 particularly with the parks that are proposed, as
21 you saw from Mr. Minervini's pictures, there is
22 vacant land, and there's a number of parcels that
23 are, you know, potential possible parks, so would
24 your answer regarding Madison and stop signs change
25 based on the fact that the parks and the potential

1 for bike lanes and/or some kind of green circuit
2 dedicated area?

3 THE WITNESS: No. I don't think it
4 would change based on what we are proposing here.

5 I think that what is being proposed
6 here will be -- there will be synergy between the
7 parks and the residents here, that they may not need
8 to get into a car to go recreate somewhere else,
9 that they will have the availability of the park and
10 walk and bike, if there are bike lanes, rather than
11 use their cars.

12 So, again, I think there will be
13 mitigating factors as those other amenities are
14 developed, parks, bike lanes, other activity on the
15 west side of Madison Street, you will have less
16 likelihood of some residents seeking that
17 opportunity elsewhere and taking advantage of those
18 amenities that you mentioned by walking or by biking
19 there, rather than using their cars --

20 MS. BANYRA: Right --

21 THE WITNESS: -- so it could have a
22 lessening effect.

23 MS. BANYRA: -- I think one of the
24 questions that Commissioner Fisher was asking about
25 was the speed of that street --

1 THE WITNESS: Yes, right.

2 MS. BANYRA: -- and as you described
3 it, it's a way, you know, in or out of the town, so
4 it is a little bit different road than a lot of the
5 other roads in town, so that is really what the
6 nature of the question is.

7 THE WITNESS: Yes. But I think the
8 proposal has less impact on the safety aspect than
9 implementing a park that would gravitate more
10 population particularly say from the east walking
11 across Madison that may cause the safety concern.

12 It is not the proposal that generates a
13 potential safety concern relative to the parks. It
14 is the parks that may generate the safety concern as
15 they attract people crossing Madison Street and
16 having more activity on Madison Street.

17 I think -- as those parks are being
18 developed, I think the safety aspects of Madison
19 Street need to be contemplated in their development
20 as opposed to what minor, very minor impact we may
21 have on the safety of Madison Street.

22 I think that answers your question.

23 MS. BANYRA: I am not concerned with
24 the safety necessarily of the vehicles coming out of
25 this, as much as the population generated from this,

1 and then going out on the street, and then going,
2 you know, to a park or going anywhere because that
3 street is that busy then, so I guess that was my
4 question.

5 THE WITNESS: But it is not just this
6 block or this street. It is the whole population to
7 the east of --

8 MS. BANYRA: I understand. But this is
9 an island right now. You know, this project right
10 now, there is nothing around it, so I guess that is
11 creating something new into an area that is a faster
12 particular speed area, but I just wanted to ask you
13 another question.

14 We had this on another project in
15 discussion with you. All of the entrances and all
16 of the access points are all two-way. The street is
17 a two-way street. Madison is a two-way street, and
18 there are three points of ingress/egress all with
19 two-way traffic on that end. You know, we had
20 talked about that last time.

21 Is there not a way that you can circle
22 people in and out and confine the movements rather
23 than have somebody on the sidewalk have to look
24 right, left, people coming in, and then they are
25 doing that multiple times down the street?

1 THE WITNESS: You make a very good
2 point, Eileen.

3 We have three driveways. The middle
4 driveway is isolated because that is a ramp that
5 takes you up.

6 But if I understand the architecture,
7 the first level is interconnected with the north
8 driveway and the southernly driveway, and
9 potentially and probably could likely make one
10 driveway inbound and the other driveway outbound
11 similar to another application, but I am not sure
12 architecturally if that could happen.

13 MR. MINERVINI: It doesn't work with
14 the phasing of the project.

15 Once the project is complete, we could
16 do that.

17 MS. BANYRA: Once it is complete,
18 right?

19 MR. MINERVINI: Yes.

20 MS. BANYRA: So temporarily it can't
21 work, but potentially in the future it could work?

22 MR. MINERVINI: Yes.

23 MS. BANYRA: Because I think that that
24 certainly is a concern. I think there is too much
25 activity, and I think going -- somebody coming in

1 and somebody coming out as you are moving down the
2 street, and there is two-way traffic, I think it is
3 more challenging. Let me put it that way. It's not
4 a challenge, but it's more challenging.

5 THE WITNESS: Yeah.

6 The only aspect I would like to take a
7 look at is what happens on the interior, because if
8 I am parked over here, that's great. If on the
9 inbound, but then on the outbound, you know, I'm
10 traveling a relatively long distance, because I have
11 to rather than a short distance.

12 So I can't say definitely yes, it is a
13 good idea, and I know it worked on another project
14 that we were here on, but being that this is a
15 bigger floor layout, it may not be as conducive to
16 that, but it's certainly worth noting and worth
17 looking at.

18 MS. BANYRA: Okay.

19 MR. MARSDEN: Mr. Staigar, are you
20 trying to say it wouldn't be more safety appropriate
21 to install stop signs where the city would like them
22 and crosswalks at the corners?

23 THE WITNESS: I'm not saying -- oh, no,
24 it would be better, yes --

25 MR. MARSDEN: I think that should be --

1 THE WITNESS: -- if that was your
2 question --

3 MS. BANYRA: That's what I was
4 asking --

5 MR. MARSDEN: -- yes.

6 MS. BANYRA: I was saying wouldn't it
7 be better if we had -- you had said it was free
8 flowing, and that is great, but I thought --

9 THE WITNESS: No, no, no. I
10 misunderstood your question then --

11 MS. BANYRA: Okay.

12 THE WITNESS: -- and yes, with or
13 without this project, and if we have any type of
14 pedestrian activity crossing Madison Street, it
15 should be done at crosswalks identified for
16 pedestrians. And if it's a mid block crosswalk or
17 some having the warning signs and such, absolutely.
18 I totally agree with that type of implementation.

19 MR. MARSDEN: I think that is what we
20 are looking for is to install crosswalks, and stop
21 signs would be the purview of the city, but to
22 discuss it with city and say, we would like to put a
23 stop sign here, and which street do you want it on
24 and determine where the stop sign goes, but install
25 crosswalks.

1 THE WITNESS: Yes. You know what,
2 particularly at our four corners, we will take a
3 look at that and, yes, crosswalks, any upgrades to
4 enhance pedestrian traffic safety, we are all for,
5 yes.

6 COMMISSIONER FISHER: So 14th Street is
7 a county road. Madison is not, right? Madison is
8 just zero --

9 THE WITNESS: Yes.

10 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Okay. Let me open it
11 up to the public, questions for the traffic planner,
12 engineer?

13 Thank you.

14 Ms. Healey?

15 MS. HEALEY: I just have one question.

16 Lea Healey.

17 14th Street is closed in front of the
18 building, correct?

19 THE WITNESS: At Jefferson.

20 MS. HEALEY: Jefferson?

21 THE WITNESS: You can't -- it has been
22 closed. You can't go from the south side of the
23 Viaduct to the north side on Jefferson. I don't
24 know what it is today. The last time I checked it
25 was a couple of weeks ago.

1 MS. HEALEY: So the southern side of
2 14th Street is going to be opened under the Viaduct?

3 THE WITNESS: To my understanding --

4 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: No.

5 MS. HEALEY: My question is --

6 THE WITNESS: -- I don't know.

7 MS. HEALEY: -- how does the fact that
8 that street will be closed affect your traffic
9 pattern?

10 THE WITNESS: Well, we went out when it
11 is closed and took traffic counts.

12 MS. HEALEY: So you took that into
13 consideration?

14 THE WITNESS: Yes. In 2013, we took
15 counts there, and we understood that 14th was
16 closed. It hadn't been in the past when we took
17 counts in 2009 and 2011, and we just compared the
18 numbers, the volumes.

19 MS. HEALEY: And so the fact that -- my
20 understanding is it will be permanently closed,
21 doesn't affect the circulation in and out of your
22 building?

23 THE WITNESS: No, it doesn't.

24 We don't have any driveways on
25 Jefferson, and all of our traffic is coming out onto

1 Madison.

2 MS. HEALEY: Okay, thank you.

3 UNIDENTIFIED VOICE: Up to the north
4 side.

5 MS. HEALEY: Okay.

6 And in terms of just this stop sign and
7 signage on Madison, if the park across the street
8 opens up on the Cognis site, does that mean you
9 would feel more strongly or less strongly that you
10 would need pedestrian safety?

11 THE WITNESS: Oh, I think you need
12 crosswalks for sure at the intersections, at 13th
13 Street, and again, I have to take a look at what is
14 happening at 14th after the Viaduct work is done.
15 But it may entail a crosswalk, a pedestrian
16 crosswalk and maybe enhanced by warning signs,
17 pedestrian warning signs, you know, pedestrian
18 crossing ahead, and identifying that the crosswalk
19 is there.

20 MS. HEALEY: Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Any other members of
22 the public have questions for the witness?

23 Seeing none, can I have a motion to
24 close the public portion?

25 COMMISSIONER MURPHY: Motion to close

1 the public portion.

2 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Second.

3 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: All in favor?

4 (All Board members answered in the
5 affirmative.)

6 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Mr. Matule, it is
7 eleven o'clock. We have one Board member who is on
8 European time, so it is about four in the morning
9 for him --

10 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Five o'clock.

11 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: -- five o'clock I am
12 informed.

13 We have the planner, and I think by
14 virtue of the conversation we just had with Mr.
15 Staigar, we will probably have similar conversation
16 with the planner, and we have public comment before
17 we even reach deliberations. I don't think we can
18 finish up tonight.

19 MR. MATULE: I fully hear what you are
20 saying, Mr. Chairman.

21 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: As much as I would
22 like to, I don't think we are going to do it.

23 MR. GALVIN: It was our plan to get you
24 through, you know.

25 MR. MATULE: I certainly appreciate

1 that. I know you donated the whole evening to this
2 application, but I also appreciate, you know, the
3 lateness of the hour.

4 MR. GALVIN: We were kicking around
5 proceeding with six, but then you are going to want
6 to have the seventh person to hear it anyhow.

7 MR. MATULE: Absolutely.

8 I guess at this point, because we do
9 have a lot of public here, could we discuss another
10 date to continue?

11 MS. BANYRA: Pat, the June meetings are
12 taken --

13 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: What is on for June?

14 MS. BANYRA: We have two or three that
15 rescheduled from the last month.

16 MS. CARCONE: Yes.

17 For the 17th we have 810-12 Paterson
18 and 307 Newark on the 17th, that is about it.

19 Go to July?

20 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: So, Mr. Matule, are
21 any of those applications yours?

22 MR. MATULE: I think they are all mine.

23 (Laughter)

24 MR. GALVIN: What a burden, huh?

25 (Laughter)

1 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: It was a wild guess.

2 MR. MATULE: I am not complaining.

3 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Is there any
4 adjustments your clients may be able to make?

5 MR. MATULE: I think on the 17th, we
6 had carried 307 Newark, the parking garage, as well
7 as 810-12 Paterson.

8 I know there is a special meeting on
9 the 24th. We are talking about a special meeting on
10 the 24th, which we have not confirmed anything up
11 on. We would love to come back on the 24th.

12 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: That would be fine.
13 Is the 24th open?

14 MS. CARCONE: It's currently open, yes,
15 if that is --

16 MR. MATULE: Mr. Staigar, is the 24th
17 good?

18 MR. STAIGAR: I will have to double
19 check it.

20 MR. MATULE: I just want to make sure
21 it is good.

22 MR. STAIGAR: Yes, I am good.

23 MR. MATULE: Okay. My professionals
24 are all good for the 24th.

25 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: We may have a conflict

1 for one of our professionals.

2 Is there any possibility we can move
3 something from the 17th to the 24th and finish this
4 on the 17th?

5 MR. MATULE: Well, I have not
6 advertised for 810-12 Paterson yet, so...

7 MR. GALVIN: What else is on that
8 night?

9 MR. MATULE: 307 Newark, the parking
10 garage, where I think we have resolved all of our
11 issues with Jefferson Trust at the last meeting.

12 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: So we just have the
13 planner.

14 MR. GALVIN: We could carry that from
15 the 17th to the 24th easily just by carrying the
16 notice.

17 MR. MATULE: What is that?

18 MR. GALVIN: 307 Newark.

19 MR. MATULE: Okay. And then do what on
20 the 17th?

21 MR. GALVIN: This.

22 MR. MATULE: Do you think we will need
23 the whole meeting for this?

24 MR. GALVIN: I have no idea, but if
25 there is a whole room of people, and your planner to

1 go, it probably shouldn't. But I mean, I was hoping
2 we could get done by midnight, but --

3 MR. MATULE: Well, if I may --

4 MR. GALVIN: -- when you have more
5 time, it expands.

6 MR. MATULE: -- if I may respectfully
7 suggest, why don't we carry this to the 17th and see
8 where it goes, and I will be standing by with 307
9 rather than starting a new matter, and perhaps we
10 could do 810-12 on the 24th or whatever, and we will
11 firm that up.

12 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Yes, that works.

13 VICE CHAIR GREENE: So should we hold
14 the 24th as a special meeting?

15 MS. BANYRA: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: So we are going to
17 carry this one without further notice to the 17th --

18 MR. MATULE: Right.

19 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: -- of June.

20 MR. MATULE: For the record, I will
21 consent to an extension of time in which the Board
22 has to act through June 17th.

23 MR. GALVIN: Thank you very much.

24 MR. MARSDEN: Can I ask that we get the
25 updated traffic report by then?

1 MR. MATULE: Yes. You will have the
2 updated traffic report and hopefully --

3 MR. GALVIN: The other thing I will say
4 to you is Mr. Marsden was freaking out with all of
5 the things that were open items on his engineering
6 report. Again, we stretched ourselves to try to get
7 you moving. You might want to look at that and see
8 what you can get done between now and that night.

9 MR. MATULE: We will revisit all of
10 that, and I appreciate your indulgence.

11 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: I think we need a
12 motion to carry without further notice.

13 VICE CHAIR GREENE: I will move it.

14 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Second.

15 MR. GALVIN: Let me just say one thing
16 for the record. The professionals were considering
17 not putting you on tonight, because we found it so
18 deficient, and we, you know, we got it together. We
19 pulled it together for you. But in a future case,
20 don't be surprised if we don't say we got it too
21 late, and we have to carry it, okay?

22 So we were generous, and I think you
23 should know when we do the right thing by you.

24 MR. MATULE: I do, and I appreciate it.

25 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: We have a motion to

1 carry without notice.

2 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Second

3 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: We have a second.

4 VICE CHAIR GREENE: I moved it.

5 MS. CARCONE: Moved by Commissioner

6 Greene, and Commissioner Owen for the second.

7 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Do a vote.

8 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Greene?

9 VICE CHAIR GREENE: Yes.

10 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner DeFusco?

11 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Yes.

12 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Murphy?

13 COMMISSIONER MURPHY: Yes.

14 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Fisher?

15 COMMISSIONER FISHER: Yes.

16 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner McAnuff?

17 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Yes.

18 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Tremitedi?

19 COMMISSIONER TREMITIEDI: Yes.

20 MS. CARCONE: Commissioner Aibel?

21 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: Yes.

22 Motion to close the meeting?

23 COMMISSIONER DE FUSCO: Motion to close

24 the meeting.

25 COMMISSIONER MC ANUFF: Second.

1 CHAIRMAN AIBEL: All in favor?

2 (All Board members answered in the
3 affirmative.)

4 (The meeting concluded at 11:05 p.m.)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I, PHYLLIS T. LEWIS, a Certified Court Reporter, Certified Realtime Court Reporter, and Notary Public of the State of New Jersey, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and accurate transcript of the testimony as taken stenographically by and before me at the time, place and date hereinbefore set forth.

I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that I am neither a relative nor employee nor attorney nor counsel to any of the parties to this action, and that I am neither a relative nor employee of such attorney or counsel, and that I am not financially interested in the action.

s/Phyllis T. Lewis, CSR, CRR

- - - - -

PHYLLIS T. LEWIS, C.S.R. XI01333 C.R.R. 30XR15300
Notary Public of the State of New Jersey
My commission expires 11/5/2015.

Dated: May 26, 2014

This transcript was prepared in accordance with NJ ADC 13:43-5.9.